# Environment-friendly Insulating Gases for HVDC Gas-insulated Transmission Lines

Geng Chen<sup>®</sup>, Youping Tu<sup>®</sup>, Cong Wang, Jue Wang, Zhikang Yuan, Guoming Ma, Senior Member, IEEE, Jian Wang, Bo Qi, and Chuanyang Li

Abstract-Environment-friendly gas insulating mediums adapted to a DC gas-insulated transmission line (GIL) electric field condition is the key to the next generation of Environment-friendly HVDC GILs. In this paper, we review the literature on sulfur hexafluoride (SF<sub>6</sub>) alternatives including the scientific understanding, control, and implementation of gas-solid systems in this type of power transmission. First, the structure-activity relationship between the molecular structure and physico-chemical properties of Environment-friendly insulating gases is presented. Then, the search and prediction of important physicochemical properties of gases are summarized. Subsequently, in view of the potential of environmental friendly insulating gases, the swarm parameters of gas discharge and breakdown properties in a quasi-uniform field, inhomogeneous field, and at the gas-solid interface, that need to be taken into account with industrialized DC GILs are discussed. The latest research progress on insulation characteristics, especially the polarity effect in DC gas-solid insulation systems, the sensitivity to the electrode surface state, and the non-uniformity of the electric field, and the influence of metal particles and their variation with air pressure, is highlighted. In addition, the heat transfer characteristics of insulating gases, related to DC GIL transmission with a large current-carrying capacity and the influence of alternative gases on the heat transfer characteristics are described. Finally, aiming at solving the contradiction of low environmental impact, high dielectric strength and low liquefaction temperatures in the selection of alternative gases, an coordinated regulation model for Environment-friendly gases in DC GILs is established. Considerations for future work on this topic are also presented.

*Index Terms*—Environmental friendly insulating gas, gasinsulated transmission line, high-voltage direct-current transmission, sulfur hexafluoride.

#### I. INTRODUCTION

W ITH the advantages of less harm to the environment, smaller land occupation for energy collection offshore

Jian Wang is with the Institute of Electrical Engineering, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing 100190, China.

C. Y. Li is with the Department of Electrical Engineering, Tsinghua University, Beijing 100084, China.

DOI: 10.17775/CSEEJPES.2019.01060

platforms and higher current-carrying power transmission [1], [2], the concept of Environment-friendly DC gas insulated transmission lines (GILs) have been developed in recent years. It is hoped that DC GILs can provide better stability in trunk network systems, increase transmission power, and address environmental problems.

Around 1940, sulfur hexafluoride  $(SF_6)$  was first used as an insulating gas for high-voltage devices in nuclear physics [3]. In 1972, SF<sub>6</sub> was used as the gas insulating medium in the first GIL launched at the Hudson Power Plant, USA [1]. At present,  $SF_6$  is still the main insulating gas used in the power industry because of its superior technical performance to that of other gases. However,  $SF_6$  gas also has some shortcomings [3].  $SF_6$ is a heavy gas with larger molecular weight and a higher liquefaction temperature than those of ordinary gases, so it is not suitable for use in very cold conditions. In addition,  $SF_6$  gas is expensive, which makes it unsuitable for electrical equipment with large gas volumes. Moreover, the electrical strength of SF<sub>6</sub> gas is affected by a non-uniform electric field, conductive particles, and electrical surface roughness. As a greenhouse gas, the global warming potential (GWP) of  $SF_6$  is 23,900 times that of carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) gas, and its life in the atmosphere is up to 3,200 years, which has a cumulative effect on global warming [4]. In the Kyoto Protocol signed by the parties to the United Nations Convention on Climate Change in 1997, SF<sub>6</sub> is listed as one of the six restricted greenhouse gases, which requires that the use of  $SF_6$  is restricted by 2020.

Therefore, it is critical to find an Environment-friendly alternative gas to  $SF_6$  for use as an insulating medium for high-voltage direct-current (HVDC) GILs to meet the Kyoto Protocol and protect the ecological environment. In addition, to understanding their gas discharge and gas-solid interface characteristics under DC electric fields, it is very important to conduct basic research on insulating gases for HVDC GILs [5].

To find Environment-friendly insulating gases suitable for DC GIL, the primary selection criteria areas are as follows: 1) Minimal environmental impact; 2) Non-liquefaction; 3) High dielectric strength, especially for DC conditions; 4) High heat dissipation.

Research on SF<sub>6</sub> substitutes has been performed for many years, but no gases better than SF<sub>6</sub> to fulfill the application criteria have yet to be found. Potential insulating gas candidates are introduced dry air, nitrogen (N<sub>2</sub>), CO<sub>2</sub>, perfluorocarbons (PFCs), hydrofluorocarbons (HFCs), and gas mixtures containing SF<sub>6</sub>. These gases do not have a higher dielectric

Manuscript received May 20, 2019; revised August 11, 2019; accepted September 19, 2019. Date of online publication October 7, 2019; date of current version December 28, 2020. This work was supported in part by the National Basic Research Program of China (973 Program) (2014CB239500).

G. Chen (ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1357-1294), Y. P. Tu (corresponding author, e-mail: typ@ncepu.edu.cn; ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7679-4180), C. Wang, Z. K. Yuan, G. M. Ma, J. Wang, and B. Qi are with the State Key Laboratory of Alternate Electrical Power System with Renewable Energy Sources and the Beijing Key Laboratory of High Voltage and EMC, North China Electric Power University, Beijing 102206, China.

strength than that of SF<sub>6</sub>, but their GWPs are lower and their boiling points are below 0 °C. Relatively well-understood gases such as dry air,  $N_2$ ,  $CO_2$ , and  $SF_6/N_2$  gas mixtures have been studied for use in GILs. Dry air, N2, and CO2 are environmentally friendly, easy to handle, and suitable for alternative dielectric (routine) tests in a factory. However, these gases have a lower dielectric performance than that of  $SF_6$ , so the size of the equipment has to be increased. Gas mixtures of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> are also included in this review because they have already been used in gas-insulated systems for more than ten years and are effective to lower the GWP of systems [6]. Other alternative gases with low GWP possibly suitable for use in gas-insulated systems are now under study. These alternative gases include trifluoroiodomethane ( $CF_3I$ ), Fluoronitrile (C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN) and Fluoroketones (C<sub>5</sub>F<sub>10</sub>O: C5 Fketone, C<sub>6</sub>F<sub>12</sub>O: C6 F-ketone), and are suggested to be used as gas mixtures with  $CO_2$  or oxygen ( $O_2$ ). These gases have excellent dielectric strength but their boiling points are higher than that of  $SF_6$  [7]–[9].

The industrial applications of environmental friendly insulating gases are countable. The compressed air was used as the insulating medium inside GIL. To achieve the same insulation performance as pure SF<sub>6</sub> gas, the inflatable pressure would have to exceed a 1 MPa. CF<sub>3</sub>I gas mixture if it was to be applied to replace SF<sub>6</sub> gas, and the results showed that the mixture of CF<sub>3</sub>I and N<sub>2</sub> with a gas volume fraction of 10%–20% was suitable as an insulating medium in GIL. In 2017, GE company successfully developed 420 kV GIL filled with G3 (C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub>) gas and put it into operation in Mannington, UK. The GIL used 4% C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/96% CO<sub>2</sub>, and the gas pressure was 0.9 MPa.

Currently, there are still many problems in the application of environmentally friendly gases in practical projects.

1) At present, the synthesis ability of alternative gases is limited and the production cost is high, which limits the promotion and application of new gases.

2) Compared with SF6, all the new gas mixtures should increase the pressure when applied in the HV GIE to improve the insulation strength. Because of this, more stringent requirements are put forward for the mechanical strength, leak-proof level and welding technology of the equipment.

3) Although GIL does not require arc extinguishing, the compatibility of environmentally friendly gases with solid insulating materials and the effect of decomposition products on insulation after long-term operation are still under study.

The year of 2020 is the time node of the Kyoto Protocol to limit the use of  $SF_6$ . Here we review the latest research progress on alternative gases to  $SF_6$ , especially for use under DC conditions. An overview of recent prior research on  $SF_6$  alternatives for gas-insulated equipment under DC stress is presented to provide inspiration for further study of DC insulation. The paper is organized as follows:

In Section II, physico-chemical properties of potential Environment-friendly gases including liquefaction characteristics, basic dielectric properties, thermo-physical properties and environmental protection-related characteristics of great concern are presented. Moreover, the effects of molecular and electronic structures on the macroscale liquefaction temperature and dielectric strength of gases, as well as the prediction of alternative gases based on structure–activity relationships and molecular design concepts is reviewed. In Section III, the gas insulation properties of substitute gases for  $SF_6$  are introduced. In Section IV, the heat transfer performance of environmentally friendly gases and their temperature rise performance in GILs are discussed. In Section V, based on the presented research and our latest results for environmentally friendly insulating gases in DC GILs, a synergistic control model of alternative gas mixtures is proposed that considers liquefaction temperature, electrical strength, GWP, and temperature rise characteristics. Criteria for use of environmentally friendly insulating gases in DC GILs are also introduced. Finally, we present a brief summary and provide some suggestions for future work in Section VI.

# II. SEARCH AND PREDICTION: PHYSICO-CHEMICAL PROPERTIES

Physico-chemical properties are the basic parameters of gases. The physical and chemical properties of the alternative insulating gases used in environmentally friendly DC GIL equipment include not only liquefaction temperature, dielectric strength, and heat transfer performance, but also factors related to environmental protection and safety, such as GWP, ODP, atmospheric retention time, and LC50. However, we have not yet found a gas that displays properties that meet all of the requirements for DC GILs at the same time. Therefore, although there are hundreds of alternative gases to  $SF_6$ , environmentally friendly insulating gases that can completely replace  $SF_6$  are still under exploration. In recent years, with the development of quantum physics theory and advanced computing technology, theoretical research on alternative gases to SF<sub>6</sub> has started to improve the efficiency of the research process. By establishing the relationship between molecular microscale parameters and macroscale properties, theoretical prediction of the properties of unknown gases can be realized, and the optimization and design of alternative gases can be conducted. This section summarizes the structure-activity relationships and physicochemical properties in environmental and functional aspects of alternative gases to  $SF_6$ .

#### A. Global Warming Potential

In order to evaluate the potential contribution of each insulation gas to global warming, the greenhouse warming potential (GWP) was devised to aid in the identification of particularly effective greenhouse gases [10]. The GWP is defined as the radiative forcing due to an instantaneous release of 1 kg of a trace substance integrated over a chosen time horizon, relative to that of 1 kg of CO<sub>2</sub>, and it has two important properties, the atmospheric lifetime ( $\tau$ ) and the radiative efficiency. It can be calculated according to the following formula:

$$GWP = \frac{\Delta F_{\rm A} \times \int_0^T A(t) dt}{\Delta F_{\rm CO_2} \times \int_0^T R(t) dt}$$
(1)

where T is the time horizon;  $\Delta F_{\rm A}$  is the radiative forcing resulting from a 1 kg increase of compound A; A(t) is the time decay of a pulse of compound A, and  $\Delta F_{\rm CO_2}$  and R(t) are the comparable quantities for the reference. Usually, the GWP was evaluated over a time horizon of 100 years assuming an exponential decay for the time evolution of the gas in the atmosphere with a rate of  $1/\tau$ , and the decay mechanism accounts for compound removal via reactions with OH only [11].

Some scholars determined the infrared absorption spectrum by measuring the reaction rate of the reaction of greenhouse gases with active species such as OH radicals, and calculated the gas lifetime and radiation efficiency, and then calculated the GWP of some greenhouse gases [12]. The previous alternative gas is often fluorocarbon, but some studies have shown that the greenhouse effect of C-F bonds is large [10], and compounds obtained by replacing one or more C-F bonds with C-O bonds have lower GWP [13]. Since 1970, the greenhouse effect of fluorocarbon bonds (CFCs), chlorocarbons, hydrofluorocarbons (HCFCs), and hydrofluorocarbons (HFCs) has gradually gained attention, and some scholars have carried out in-depth research [14]. G. Acerboni et al. have found that due to the short life span of  $C_2F_4$ ,  $C_3F_6$ and  $C_4F_6$ , the greenhouse effect of them could be almost ignored [15]. The atmospheric lifetime and GWP of  $CH_4$  are much lower than greenhouse gases such as  $CO_2$  and  $SF_6$  [10]. Since halogenated olefins have a C=C bond, their lifetime is shorter than similar saturated compounds. Therefore, shortchain halogenated olefins could be used as substitutes for saturated halogenated hydrocarbons [15].

With the advancement of computer technology, the density functional theory (DFT) has been proven to calculate parameters such as radiation efficiency [16]. Some scholars combined the functional group contribution method to calculate the reaction rate of gas containing special functional groups with atmospheric OH radicals, atmospheric lifetime of gas, radiation efficiency, etc., and obtained their GWP [17]. Franck limited the molecular size to a maximum of 15 atoms and allowed only compositions of the elements: C, H, F, Cl, Br, N and S. And he calculated a variety of chemical gases. Finally, several candidate gases were obtained [11]. Some studies found that for molecules with the same structure, as the number of F atoms increases, the GWP value of the gas increases.

## B. Intrinsic Dielectric Strength

The electrical strength (ES) of gases is determined by the microstructure of the gas molecules. The microscopic properties of gas could be used to screen and predict the electrical strength of the replacement gas, which can improve the efficiency of finding new replacement gases.

High electrical strength gas has similar molecular structure rules [18]. There is a significant relationship between ES and properties such as molecular weight, quantity, and chemical structure [19], and ES tends to increase with increasing molecular weight [20]. For hydrocarbon gases, many scholars have found that the main factors affecting the ES of saturated and unsaturated hydrocarbons are the number of C-H bonds [21], [22] and the number of C=C bonds [23].

Some scholars have studied the relationship between ES and parameters such as polarizability, ionization energy [24],

[25], electron affinity [26], and light absorption spectrum integration (IOA) [27]. Based on the DFT calculation method, Franck *et al.* established a multivariate regression model of microscopic parameters and insulation properties [28]. Xiao and other scholars examined the relationship between the electronic affinity energy, molecular volume, LUMO energy level and other electrical properties of some organic gases, and found that a high electrical strength gas often has C=C double bonds and C $\equiv$ N bonds [29].

Wang believes that the cross section of gas molecules is proportional to the surface electrostatic potential, and proposed a new structure-activity relationship (SAR) model [30]. It was found that  $CF_3$  is the most effective functional group to improve ES due to its large surface area and polarizability, and  $SF_5CN$  and  $SF_5CFO$  were found to be the potent candidates to replace  $SF_6$  [30]. Because molecular ionization energy and electron affinity energy are difficult to obtain [31], Wang and other scholars abandoned the ion calculation, and adopted parameters of physical meaning in neutral molecules to obtain a better performance SAR Model [32]. Li and other scholars also believed that the surface electrostatic potential is strongly correlated with the ES, and they found that ES will be stronger with the increase of the relative molecular mass of the halogen element [33].

After searching and screening, it was found that  $CF_3I$ ,  $C_3F_8$ , c- $C_4F_8$  and other gases are expected to replace  $SF_6$  as an environmentally friendly gas. In recent years, ALSTOM and 3 M have developed  $C_3F_7CN$  with good insulation properties, in which the gas molecule has a unique C=N bond. ABB has proposed organic fluorinated gases with C=O bond such as  $C_5F_{10}O$  and  $C_6F_{12}O$ .

# C. Liquefaction

In practical applications, the choice of insulating gas type and mixing ratio is restricted by liquefaction temperature, which is also called the boiling point. Therefore, the liquefaction temperature should be focused on in the search and prediction process to ensure the practical applicability of an insulating gas.

Scholars from Tsinghua University measured the saturated vapor pressure of  $CF_3I$  in the temperature range of 243.15– 393.15 K, and summarized an equation with four parameters that can accurately calculate the boiling point  $(T_{\rm B})$  of CF<sub>3</sub>I. The saturated vapor pressure of SF<sub>6</sub> is much higher than the value of CF<sub>3</sub>I at the same temperature [34]. The saturated vapor pressure of  $CF_3I/N_2$  is higher than that of  $c-C_4F_8/N_2$ for a certain mixed ratio, which means that CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub> mixtures can be used for higher operating pressures. It is found that  $CF_3I/N_2$  gas mixture has a better potential as an alternative gas [35]. D. M. Xiao et al. ignored the effect of buffer gas and calculated the  $T_{\rm B}$  of CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub> [36] and C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> [37] gas mixture using the Van Der Waals equation. The boiling point of  $CF_3I/CO_2(40\%/60\%)$  is about -5 °C at 0.5 MPa [38]. When the content of C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN in C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixture is about 5% and 10%, the  $T_{\rm B}$  of the gas mixture is as low as -30 °C and -10 °C respectively [39], which is a powerful candidate to replace SF<sub>6</sub>.

Wang found that the balance between ES and  $T_{\rm B}$  can be

achieved by minimizing the local polarity of the molecule [30]. Polarizability, ionization energy [24], [25], dipole moment and electron affinity [40] have important influences on the  $T_{\rm B}$ . Based on the DFT calculation, Franck *et al.* observed strong correlation between the  $T_{\rm B}$  and some predictors in nonpolar molecules [28]. Li has proposed the effect of halogen substitution on the  $T_{\rm B}$  of gas molecules and its variation [33].

Tu considered the interaction of various components in the gas mixture, and used the Peng-Robinson (PR) equation and the Van der Waals equation (PR-vdW method) to analyze the gas-liquid equilibrium data of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub>, SF<sub>6</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub> [41] and CF<sub>3</sub>I/CO<sub>2</sub> [42] gas mixture. Yuan used the PR-vdW model to calculate the dew point temperature ( $T_B$ ) of the binary gas mixture, with SF<sub>6</sub>, C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>8</sub>, c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>, CF<sub>3</sub>I and C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN as the insulating gas and N<sub>2</sub> or CO<sub>2</sub> as buffer gas. The dew point temperatures of the SF<sub>6</sub> substitute gases at different pressures and the upper limits of the insulating gas mole fraction at  $-30^{\circ}$ C,  $-20^{\circ}$ C and  $-10^{\circ}$ C were obtained [43]. The relationship between pressure, temperature and the  $T_B$  of C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/N<sub>2</sub> and C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixture is shown in Fig. 1.

### D. Heat Dissipation

Convection is the dominant type of heat transfer in GILs. Therefore, the heat transfer performance is closely related to the gas flow. Heat transfer properties include many thermosphysical parameters such as gas density, thermal conductivity, capacity, and dynamic viscosity. According to Technical Brochure 218, WG 23/21/33-15 [44], Vermeer's constant is linked to the physical properties of gases, according to the following formula.

$$C = 0.1638 \left(\frac{\rho^2 \lambda^2 C_{\rm p}}{\eta}\right)^{\frac{1}{3}} \tag{2}$$

where  $\rho$  is the density,  $\lambda$  is the thermal conductivity,  $C_{\rm p}$  is the specific heat capacity and  $\eta$  is the dynamic viscosity.

For the convective heat transfer coefficient of gas mixtures, it can be calculated by the following formula.

$$C_{\rm mix} = C_1(x_1)^{0.75} + C_2(x_2)^{0.75}$$
(3)

where  $C_1$ ,  $C_2$ ,  $x_1$  and  $x_2$  are the convection coefficient and volume fraction of two kinds of gas in the mixture.

It can be seen that the gases with high molecular weight, high thermal conductivity, high heat capacity and low dynamic viscosity are the good choices for insulating gases in large



Fig. 1. Dew point temperatures of  $C_3F_7CN$  mixtures at different pressures. (a)  $C_3F_7CN/N_2$ . (b)  $C_3F_7CN/CO_2$  [43].

current-carrying-capacity DC GILs. The Vermeer's constant of  $C_3F_7CN$ ,  $SF_6$  and  $CO_2$  at standard atmospheric pressure according to (3), are 13.8, 11.3 and 6.10, respectively [45]. This indicates that  $C_3F_7CN$  gas has a better heat dissipation performance than  $SF_6$  and  $CO_2$  gases. The heat dissipation of the gas mixture is a bit lower than pure SF6 but still significantly higher than  $CO_2$ .

# E. Physicochemical Properties of Main Alternative Gases to $SF_6$

In recent years, the physico-chemical properties of the main alternative gases to  $SF_6$  and buffer gases have been investigated extensively. Major parameters for these gases are summarized in Table I. In Table I, ozone depletion potential (ODP) is applied to assess the potential implications for ozone depletion of the gases. The 50% lethal concentration 50

 TABLE I

 Physico-chemical Properties of Gases

Molecular	Environmental and safety			Functional			
formula	GWP	ODD	Atmos	LC50 mm $(1 h)$	Boiling	Dielectric	Heat transfer
	(IPCC 2013)	ODF	lifetime (years)	LC30, ppiii (4 ii)	point (°C)	strength (SF <sub>6</sub> )	coefficient
SF <sub>6</sub>	23900	0	3400	-	-63	1	11.3
Dry Air	0	0	-	-	-	0.33	5.1
$N_2$	0	0	-	-	-195.8	0.3-0.4	5.83
$CO_2$	1	0	-	> 300000	-78.5	0.3-0.4	6.1
$CF_4$	6500	0	5000	895000 (0.25 h)	-128	0.39	-
c-C <sub>4</sub> F <sub>8</sub>	10300	0	3200	780000 (2 h)	-6.04	1.25	-
$CF_3I$	0.45	0.0001	< 0.005	160000	-22.5	1.3	-
$C_4F_7N$	2210	0	30	12000-15000	-4.7	2.1	13.8
$C_5F_{10}O$	1	0	0.014	> 20000	26	2	-
$C_6F_{12}O$	1	0	0.014	> 10000	49	2.8	-

(LC50) refers to the concentration of poisons that cause half of the animals to die in acute toxicity tests, which is conducive to quantitative comparison of toxicity of different gases.

Predicting the physico-chemical properties of gases using computational methods and then carrying out targeted research on gases predicted to have desirable properties represents an advance over traditional experimental research methods because this new approach can accelerate research progress.

#### III. RE-EXAMINATION: INSULATION PROPERTIES

At present, the main gas insulating medium used in AC transmission pipelines is  $SF_6$ . The insulation design of pipelines is also based on the discharge characteristics of  $SF_6$ and the flashover voltage along the gas-solid interface. However, the insulation design for HVDC GILs is quite different from that of AC transmission pipelines. First, the discharge properties of gases vary at different voltage polarities. Subsequently, the electrode surface roughness and partial discharge (PD) characteristics also affect insulating behavior. The charge accumulation of insulating materials under DC voltage will directly affect the gas-solid insulation performance. Moreover, metal particles strongly influence the behavior of gas-solid interfaces.

To determine the insulation properties of environmental friendly gases, the research on the swarm parameter is reviewed in this section. Then, breakdown properties in the gas gap and at the gas-solid interface are reviewed.

# A. Electron Swarm Parameter Measurements of Identified Alternative Gases

At low pressure, the  $\gamma$  process could be ignored in the study of insulation gas discharge. According to the Townsend discharge theory, when E/N (E is the electric field strength, and N is the number of gas molecules per unit volume) exceeds  $E/N_{(\text{lim})}$ , the self-sustaining discharge condition is satisfied, and the  $E/N_{(\text{lim})}$  could be used to characterize ES [25]. Furthermore, studying the electron swarm parameters during gas discharge can guide the choice of the type and mixing ratio of the insulating gas.

Swarm parameters including the ionization coefficient, attachment coefficient, electron drift velocity and electron diffusion velocity can be obtained by measuring the current or luminous flux during discharge. The steady-state Townsend method (SST) [46], [47] and the pulse Townsend method (PT) [48] are two experimental methods. In addition, collision cross sections of gas can be used to calculate the electron swarm parameters, including the Monte Carlo simulation calculation and Boltzmann equation method, etc. [49].

## 1) Experimental Method

At present, compressed dry air and N<sub>2</sub> have been used in medium voltage switchgear [50]. Many scholars have experimented with conventional gases to obtain their  $(E/N)_{\text{lim}}$  [25], [51]–[54], where N<sub>2</sub> is 128.3 Td, CO<sub>2</sub> is 104.7 Td, and SF<sub>6</sub> is 361.4 Td (1 Td =  $10^{-21}$  Vm<sup>2</sup>). Urquijo *et al.* used the PT method to study the electron swarm parameters of CO<sub>2</sub> and its mixture with SF<sub>6</sub>, N<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>2</sub> [55], [56]. The swarm parameters of SF<sub>6</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub> and SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures were studied by the PT method [46], [55], [57]–[59], and it was found that the  $SF_6/N_2$  gas mixture is more suitable [60], [61].

CSEE IOURNAL OF POWER AND ENERGY SYSTEMS VOL. 7 NO. 3 MAY 2021

In view of the alternative gases on  $SF_6$ , some scholars measured the swarm parameters by PT method including the ionization coefficient, attachment coefficient and electron drift velocity of perfluoroalkanes n- $C_N F_{2N+2}$  (N = 1-4) [62], [63]. It was found that the  $E/N_{\text{(lim)}}$  of CF<sub>4</sub> is 123.8 Td [64], and the  $E/N_{\text{(lim)}}$  of c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub> is 439.5 Td [65]. Urquijo and Xiao studied the swarm parameters and  $E/N_{(lim)}$  of CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub> [66] and c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/CF<sub>4</sub> [67] gas mixture respectively, which provided a basis for the selection of the mixing ratio. Nechml [68], Franck [69] and other scholars tested the swarm parameters of  $C_3F_7CN/CO_2$  and  $C_3F_7CN/N_2$  gas mixtures at low mixing ratio, and found that the mixing gas has a synergistic effect, which verifies the feasibility of using the  $C_3F_7CN$  gas mixture instead of SF<sub>6</sub>. In addition, Franck also studied the swarm parameters of the  $C_5F_{10}O/N_2$ ,  $C_5F_{10}O/CO_2$  gas mixture at a low mix ratio [70].

Tu *et al.* have obtained the  $E/N_{(\text{lim})}$  of the C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub> and C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixture at different mixing ratios by the SST method. It was found that the ES of the C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixture is better than that of the C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixture, and there is a synergistic effect between the two gas mixtures. When the ratio of C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN reaches 6.8%, the coefficient of synergistic effect of the C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixture reaches the maximum [71].

### 2) Calculation Method

The electron swarm parameters of the binary gas mixtures of  $CO_2/N_2$  and  $CO_2/O_2$  have been calculated by the scholars using the Monte Carlo and the Boltzmann equation calculation method. It was found that the  $(E/N)_{\text{lim}}$  of the  $CO_2/O_2$  gas mixture is higher than that of the  $CO_2/N_2$ gas mixture [60]. Using the Monte Carlo calculation and Boltzmann equation method based on two-term approximations [72], [73], Dincer, Xiao, and Li calculated the swarm parameters of  $SF_6/N_2$  [74],  $SF_6/CO_2$  [75],  $SF_6/CF_4$  [76] and hot  $SF_6/CF_4$  [77] gas mixtures.

For the new environmental gases, scholars calculated the swarm parameters of the CF<sub>3</sub>I gas mixture by solving twoterm approximation Boltzmann equations, and found that the  $(E/N)_{\text{lim}}$  of CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub> and CF<sub>3</sub>I/air gas mixtures is the largest [78], [79]. Xiao et al. proposed a new group of collision cross sections, and the swarm parameters of the C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixture were calculated by solving the Boltzmann equation. The  $(E/N)_{\text{lim}}$  of C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>8</sub> is 337 Td [80], while the  $(E/N)_{\text{lim}}$  of the C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixture is larger than that of  $C_3F_8/CO_2$  [37]. Xiao and Li *et al.* calculated the swarm parameters of the c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub> gas mixtures, and found that the  $(E/N)_{\text{lim}}$  of the c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> and c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/air gas mixtures are the largest, and the ES of the  $c-C_4F_8/N_2$  gas mixture is comparable to  $SF_6/N_2$  [81]. When the mixing ratio exceeds 80%, the ES of the c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub> gas mixture is higher than that of pure  $SF_6$  [82], which has potential to be an alternative gas. In addition, parameters such as electron density can be calculated by means of quantum code. The DM formula was modified by changing the weighting factors, and the collision cross sections of C3F7CN and C5F10O were calculated, which provided a theoretical basis for further study of C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN and

C<sub>5</sub>F<sub>10</sub>O [83].

Table II summarize the  $(E/N)_{\text{lim}}$  of insulation gases.

TABLE II  $(E/N)_{\text{LIM}}$  of Insulation Gases

Gas	$(E/N)_{\lim}$ (Td)	Gas	$(E/N)_{\text{lim}}$ (Td)
$N_2$	128.3 [51]	$C_3F_8$	337.0 [80]
$CO_2$	104.7 [51]	c-C <sub>4</sub> F <sub>8</sub>	439.5 [65]
$SF_6$	361.4 [51]	$C_3F_7CN$	981.8 [68]
$CF_3I$	473.0 [66]	$C_5F_{10}O$	757.0 [70]
$CF_4$	123.8 [64]		

# B. Breakdown Properties of Potential Gases

### 1) Breakdown Properties in Quasi-uniform Fields

Swarm parameters cannot reflect the breakdown at high pressure, so breakdown experiments are necessary.

The study of  $SF_6$  gas mixtures began in the 1970 s. The buffer gases used with  $SF_6$  were primarily  $N_2$ ,  $CO_2$ ,  $CF_4$ , and inert gases. The gas mixtures were used as insulating mediums in high-voltage power equipment, thereby decreasing the amount of  $SF_6$  needed. Because this approach directly lowers the amount of  $SF_6$  used, the GWP of the gas mixture is decreased. As the amount of  $SF_6$  is decreased, the cost and liquefaction temperature of the gas mixtures are also lowered. Therefore, gas mixtures can meet the requirements of gas insulation applications in high-pressure or low-temperature environments.

Woo et al. [84] studied the lightning impulse (LI) characteristics of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures with different proportions under slightly non-uniform electric fields. The results showed that the breakdown voltage ( $V_{\rm B}$ ) of the 50% SF<sub>6</sub>/50% N<sub>2</sub> gas mixture was 8%-12% higher than that of the 20% SF<sub>6</sub>/80% N<sub>2</sub> gas mixture. Qiu and co-workers studied the breakdown characteristics of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> and SF<sub>6</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures [85]-[88]. Their results showed that the breakdown field strength of  $SF_6/N_2$  was higher than that of  $SF_6/CO_2$  mixed gas under both slightly non-uniform and uniform electric fields. Zhou et al. [89] and Zhang et al. [90] studied the synergistic effects of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures under LI conditions. The results showed that in quasi-uniform electric fields, the insulation strength of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> increased with the SF<sub>6</sub> content in the gas mixture and tended to become saturated. Wang and colleagues studied the relationship between  $V_{\rm B}$  and the proportion of SF<sub>6</sub> in  $SF_6/N_2$  gas mixtures using ball-plate electrodes and power frequency voltages [91], [92]. Larin et al. [93] studied the synergistic effect of SF<sub>6</sub>/CF<sub>4</sub> gas mixtures under uniform electric fields. They found that the promotion of ionization by  $SF_6$  and the inhibition of ionization by  $CF_4$  were the main reasons for the synergistic behavior of  $SF_6/CF_4$  mixtures. Berg *et al.* [94] investigated the AC, DC, and LI breakdown characteristics of  $SF_6/CF_4$  mixtures under uniform and slightly non-uniform electric fields. Their results showed that the breakdown field strength of the gas mixture depended linearly on the content of  $SF_6$ . The discharge characteristics of  $SF_6$ gas mixtures under uniform, quasi-uniform, and slightly nonuniform electric fields are summarized as shown in Table III.

Tu *et al.* [95] studied the DC breakdown and LI characteristics of 30% SF<sub>6</sub>/70% N<sub>2</sub> and 20% SF<sub>6</sub>/80% N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures under a uniform electric field. They found that the breakdown strength of 30% SF<sub>6</sub>/70% N<sub>2</sub> at 0.6 MPa and 20% SF<sub>6</sub>/80% N<sub>2</sub> at 0.7 MPa was comparable to that of SF<sub>6</sub> at 0.5 MPa, as shown in Fig. 2. At present, SF<sub>6</sub> gas mixtures are widely used in high-voltage power equipment [96].



Fig. 2. Breakdown field strength ( $E_{DC}$ ,  $E_{LI}$ ) of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> mixtures normalized by SF<sub>6</sub>, 0.4 MPa. (a) DC breakdown characteristics. (b) Lightning impulse breakdown characteristics [95].

TABLE III STUDY ON BREAKDOWN PROPERTIES OF  $SF_6G$  as Mixtures

Authors	Gas	Voltage	Electric Field Property	Gas Pressure (MPa)
Su-Youl Woo et al. [84]	$SF_6/N_2$	LI	Quasi-uniform	0.3–0.7
Y.C. Qiu et al. [85]–[88]	SF <sub>6</sub> /N <sub>2</sub> SF <sub>6</sub> /CO <sub>2</sub>	AC/DC	Quasi-uniform	0.1–0.4
Q.G. Zhang et al. [89]	$SF_6/N_2$	LI	Slightly non-uniform	0.1-0.4
W.J. Zhou et al. [90]	$SF_6/N_2$	LI	Slightly non-uniform	0.7
H. Wang et al. [91], [92]	$SF_6/N_2$	AC	Slightly non-uniform	0.1-0.4
Larin et al. [93]	$SF_6/CF_4$	-	theoretical analysis	-
J. Berg et al. [94]	$SF_6/CF_4$	AC/DC/LI	Uniform/Quasi-uniform	0.2-0.4

However, SF<sub>6</sub> gas mixtures still employ SF<sub>6</sub> as the main insulating medium, so their use only slows down the impact of SF<sub>6</sub> on the environment. At the same time, because of the lower insulation strength of its gas mixtures than that of pure SF<sub>6</sub>, it is necessary to increase the gas pressure of the equipment, which may introduce additional costs to industrial production. At present, researchers are searching for new environmentally friendly insulating gases, such as CF<sub>3</sub>I, C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN, c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>, and C<sub>5</sub>F<sub>10</sub>O, to achieve complete replacement of SF<sub>6</sub>. However, such gases have high liquefaction temperatures and require mixing with buffer gases (CO<sub>2</sub> or N<sub>2</sub>) when used under high-pressure conditions. The discharge characteristics of new environmentally friendly insulating gases are presented in Table IV.

Tu et al. studied the DC breakdown characteristics of CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub>, C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub>, and C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures [95], [99], [100]. The results for  $CF_3I/N_2$  showed that the insulation performance of 20% CF<sub>3</sub>I/80%  $N_2$  at 0.2–0.25 MPa and 30% CF<sub>3</sub>I/70% N<sub>2</sub> at 0.15–0.25 MPa was suitable for these mixtures to replace SF<sub>6</sub> in the DC GILs of distribution networks. For the insulation strength of the gas mixtures did not increase remarkably with the increase of ratios and pressure, it is suggested that the 10% SF<sub>6</sub>/20% CF<sub>3</sub>I/70% N<sub>2</sub> gas mixture at 0.2–0.25 MPa may be a suitable alternative gas to  $SF_6$  in extremely cold regions. Under a uniform electric field, the DC breakdown field strengths of C3F7CN/CO2 and C3F7CN/N2 mixtures increased with the gas pressure. At 0.7 MPa, the negative DC breakdown field strengths of 4% C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/96% CO<sub>2</sub> and 8% C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/92% CO<sub>2</sub> reached 81.21% and 96.5% compared with  $SF_6$  at 0.5 MPa, respectively. The negative DC breakdown field strength of 14% C3F7CN/86% N2 gas mixture reached 87.3% compared with SF<sub>6</sub> at 0.4 MPa [106]-[108]. The DC breakdown electrical strength of environmental friendly insulating gases are shown in Fig. 3.

Under DC electric fields, the insulation properties of gases are sensitive to the surface roughness of the electrodes. The influence of electrode surface roughness on the breakdown strength of an insulating gas is directly related to the type of  $SF_6$  alternative used. Multiple groups have studied the



Fig. 3. The Weibull distribution of DC breakdown electrical strength of environmental friendly insulating gases.

influence of electrode surface roughness on the breakdown strength of SF<sub>6</sub> [112]–[114]. Farish et al. [115] theoretically calculated the influence of electrode surface roughness on the  $V_{\rm B}$  of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> mixtures. Their results showed that adding  $N_2$  to SF<sub>6</sub> can lower the sensitivity of the insulating gas to the electrode surface roughness. Qiu et al. [116], [117] studied the influence of electrode surface roughness on  $SF_6/N_2$ and  $SF_6/CO_2$  gas mixtures. They found that although the addition of N2 or CO2 to SF6 can decrease the sensitivity of the dielectric strength to surface roughness, the breakdown strength of  $SF_6$  was still higher than that of  $SF_6/N_2$ . The breakdown strength of SF<sub>6</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub> was slightly higher than that of SF<sub>6</sub> only when the electrode surface roughness reached a certain level. Tu et al. used plate-plate electrodes to measure the DC breakdown field strengths of SF<sub>6</sub>, 6% C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/94%  $CO_2$ , and 20% SF<sub>6</sub>/80% N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures using electrodes with different surface roughness levels. The results showed that the DC breakdown field strengths of the insulating gases became saturated with rising gas pressure and the saturation was more obvious with the increase of electrode surface roughness. The 6% C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/94% CO<sub>2</sub> mixture was less sensitive to the electrode surface roughness than SF<sub>6</sub> and the 20% SF<sub>6</sub>/80%

Authors	Gas	Voltage Property	Electric Field Property	Gas Pressure	
Ngoc M N et al. [97]	CF <sub>3</sub> I/N <sub>2</sub>	DC	Quasi-uniform	Pressure-distance up to 5 mm bar	
H. Katagiri et al. [38]	CF <sub>3</sub> I/N <sub>2</sub> CF <sub>3</sub> I/CO <sub>2</sub>	LI	Slightly non-uniform	0.1 MPa	
L. J. Chen et al. [98], [99]	CF <sub>3</sub> I/N <sub>2</sub> CF <sub>3</sub> I/CO <sub>2</sub>	LI	Slightly non-uniform	0.1–0.2 MPa	
Y. P. Tu et al. [95], [100]	CF <sub>3</sub> I/N <sub>2</sub>	DC	Uniform/	0.1–0.7 MPa	
H. E. Nechmi et al. [101]	C <sub>3</sub> F <sub>7</sub> CN/CO <sub>2</sub>	AC, LI	Slightly non-uniform	0.1–1 MPa	
X. W. Li et al. [102]	C <sub>3</sub> F <sub>7</sub> CN/CO <sub>2</sub> CF <sub>3</sub> I/N <sub>2</sub>		Theoretical calculation		
Y. Kieffel et al. [103], [104]	C <sub>3</sub> F <sub>7</sub> CN/CO <sub>2</sub>	AC, LI	Slightly non-uniform	0.1 MPa	
	C <sub>3</sub> F <sub>7</sub> CN/CO <sub>2</sub>				
J. Owens et al. [105]	C <sub>3</sub> F <sub>7</sub> CN/N <sub>2</sub>	AC	Uniform	0.1–1 MPa	
	C <sub>3</sub> F <sub>7</sub> CN/Air				
<b>V P</b> Tu <i>et al</i> [1061_[108]	C <sub>3</sub> F <sub>7</sub> CN/CO <sub>2</sub>	DC	Uniform	0.3_0.7 MPa	
1. 1. 1u ei ui. [100]–[108]	C <sub>3</sub> F <sub>7</sub> CN/N <sub>2</sub>	DC	Chinomi	0.3–0.7 WI a	
	c-C <sub>4</sub> F <sub>8</sub> /Air				
Yamamoto O et al. [109]	c-C <sub>4</sub> F <sub>8</sub> /CO <sub>2</sub>	AC	Quasi-uniform Slightly non-uniform	0.1–0.4 MPa	
	$c-C_4F_8/N_2$				
P.Yan, J.Wang et al. [110], [111]	$c-C_4F_8/N_2$	AC, DC	Slightly non-uniform	0.15–0.5 MPa	

TABLE IV Study on Breakdown Properties of Environmentally Friendly Insulating Gases

 $N_2$  gas mixture, as shown in Fig. 4.



Fig. 4. Relationship between the positive and negative breakdown field strengths and electrode surface roughness for  $6\% C_3F_7CN/94\% CO_2$ ,  $20\% SF_6/80\% N_2$ , and  $SF_6$  at 0.4 MPa.

A GIL has a coaxial structure that is dominated by a quasiuniform electric field. The influence of the non-uniformity of the electric field on the insulation performance of alternative gases to  $SF_6$  should be examined.

Zhang et al. [118] studied the effect of electric-field nonuniformity on the discharge characteristics of  $SF_6/N_2$  gas mixtures under power frequency electric fields. Under slightly non-uniform electric fields, the  $V_{\rm B}$  of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> tended to become saturated as the non-uniformity of the electric field increased and the influence of air pressure on  $V_{\rm B}$  became weak. Zhang and colleagues studied the AC breakdown characteristics of CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub> mixed gas under different electric fields [119], [120]. They found that with increasing electric field utilization coefficient, the AC  $V_{\rm B}$  of the CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub> mixture increased gradually with the linear growth rate of gas pressure. This result indicates that the more uniform the electric field, the better the AC breakdown characteristics of the CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub> mixture. Tu et al. measured  $V_{\rm B}$  of 6% C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/94% CO<sub>2</sub> under slightly non-uniform electric fields, and compared the results with those for SF<sub>6</sub> and 20% SF<sub>6</sub>/80% N<sub>2</sub>. The electrodes used in their experiments are shown in Fig. 5.



Fig. 5. Electrodes system for breakdown experiments under different electricfield non-uniformity (a) Hemispherical rod-plate electrodes and (b) cone-plate electrodes used to study the breakdown voltage of 6%  $C_3F_7CN/94\%$  CO<sub>2</sub> under slightly non-uniform electric fields.

Figure 5(a) depicts the hemispherical rod-plate electrodes. The hemisphere diameter was 20 mm, the spacing between the electrodes was 3.5 mm, and an unevenness coefficient of 1.2 was obtained through a simulation. Figure 5(b) displays the cone-plate electrodes with an electrode spacing of 3.5 mm and curvature of the cone regions of 5 and 3.5 mm; the unevenness coefficients (f) obtained from simulations were 1.4 and 1.6, respectively. The negative DC breakdown field strengths of 6% C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/94% CO<sub>2</sub>, 20% SF<sub>6</sub>/80% N<sub>2</sub>, and SF<sub>6</sub> were obtained. The negative DC breakdown field strength of each gas system decreased linearly with increasing electrode unevenness. The breakdown field strengths SF<sub>6</sub> and C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub> showed similar declines and were lower than that of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub>, as shown in Fig. 6.



Fig. 6. Relationship between positive and negative breakdown field strengths and electric-field non-uniformity for  $6\% C_3F_7CN/94\% CO_2$ ,  $20\% SF_6/80\% N_2$ , and  $SF_6$  gas systems at 0.4 MPa.

# 2) Breakdown and Partial Discharge Properties in Nonuniform Electric Fields

In GILs, typical defects like needle-shaped protrusions or metallic particles lead to strong local non-uniform electric fields, resulting in a considerable decrease of the discharge inception voltage. The influence of defects on the PD and breakdown properties of gases under DC voltage is the main topic of this section. First, the influence of fixed protrusions on gas insulation behavior is described. Then, information about particle movement and the subsequent influence on PD and breakdown properties are discussed. Finally, the particle discharge properties under AC and DC voltages for potential alternative gases and SF<sub>6</sub> are compared. A highly non-uniform electric field distribution is generally simulated by using needle-plate or rod-plate electrodes with a small tip curvature radius or tip-plate electrodes. Non-uniform electric field distributions can also be emulated using a metal protrusion with a certain length attached to a spherical electrode [109], parallel plates [121], [122], or a smooth HVDC conductor [123], [124].

Many researchers have conducted experiments on the breakdown performance of SF<sub>6</sub> and its mixtures with CO<sub>2</sub>, N<sub>2</sub>, and PFCs [125] under highly non-uniform fields using the action of AC and impulse voltages [126]–[130]. DC breakdown characteristics under highly non-uniform fields have also been determined. Qiu and Kuffel found that the positive DC  $V_{\rm B}$ of 20% SF<sub>6</sub>/80% CO<sub>2</sub> and 20% SF<sub>6</sub>/80% N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures were both 43% higher than that of SF<sub>6</sub> gas at 0.22 MPa for GILs [131]. Malik and co-workers studied the DC insulation characteristics of  $SF_6/N_2$  gas mixtures using a needle-plate electrode system [132]. They found that the  $V_B$  of 0.1%  $SF_6/99.9\% N_2$  was 50% compared with  $SF_6$  and 2.5 to 3 times that of  $N_2$ . The breakdown level of 5%  $SF_6/95\% N_2$  was 65% compared with  $SF_6$ . The  $V_B$  of 85%  $SF_6/15\% N_2$  with a wide electrode gap was almost the same as that  $SF_6$  and even higher than that of  $SF_6$  in some cases. Zhang *et al.* evaluated the DC  $V_B$  of  $SF_6/CF_4$  gas mixtures to analyze the effects of electric field non-uniformity on breakdown characteristics at different mixing ratios and gas pressures [133]. They found that the  $V_B$ of a 20%  $SF_6/80\% CF_4$  gas mixture was 29.7% higher than that of  $CF_4$  gas.

The insulation properties of SF<sub>6</sub>-free gases under highly non-uniform fields are of current interest. To obtain the same dielectric strength of SF<sub>6</sub>, it is necessary to raise the pressure by 3 to 4 times [134] because the dielectric strength values of conventional environmental friendly gases are only 20%– 40% compared with SF<sub>6</sub> at the same pressure. Wada *et al.* reported the breakdown characteristics of CO<sub>2</sub> and N<sub>2</sub> under non-standard LI [135]–[137]. It was found that the DS of CO<sub>2</sub> was 1.1 to 1.6 times higher than that of a standard waveform, and the positive non-standard LI V<sub>B</sub> of N<sub>2</sub> was 106%–167% of that under standard LI.

Extensive research on CF<sub>3</sub>I gas mixtures with CO<sub>2</sub>, N<sub>2</sub>, and CF<sub>4</sub> as substitutes for SF<sub>6</sub> has been reported in recent years. However, few studies of the dielectric strength of such mixtures under DC voltage have been reported. Most work has focused on AC and standard LI breakdown characteristics. The groups of Kamarudin [7], Xiao [138]–[140], and Zhang [141], [142] have conducted much research in this area. The dielectric strength values of  $CF_3I/CO_2$  mixtures containing 30%–40% CF<sub>3</sub>I have exceeded that of SF<sub>6</sub> gas at 0.15–0.20 MPa and can be applied to cubicle-type gas-insulated switchgear (C-GIS). The  $U_{50\%}$  value of a 35% CF<sub>3</sub>I/70% N<sub>2</sub> mixture is lower than that of 20% SF<sub>6</sub>/80% N<sub>2</sub>. The AC  $V_{\rm B}$  values of CF<sub>3</sub>I/CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures are slightly higher than those of CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures, and the AC withstand voltage level of 20% CF<sub>3</sub>I/80% N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures can reach that of SF<sub>6</sub>. The ratios of the AC withstand voltages of a 30% CF<sub>3</sub>I/70% N<sub>2</sub> gas mixture to those of SF<sub>6</sub> and a 20% SF<sub>6</sub>/80% N<sub>2</sub> mixture are about 55% and 75%, respectively. It has been suggested that  $CF_3I/N_2$  gas mixtures with 20%–30%  $CF_3I$  are suitable for use as the insulation medium in low-voltage electrical equipment. In addition, the AC withstand level of CF<sub>3</sub>I/CF<sub>4</sub> gas mixtures is 59%–120% that of SF<sub>6</sub> and 15%–20% that of CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures.

Considerable research has been conducted on PFC gases, including mixtures of  $c-C_4F_8$ ,  $C_3F_8$ , and  $C_2F_6$ . Okabe *et al.* [143] measured the AC  $V_B$  of 10% PFC/90% CO<sub>2</sub> and 10% PFC/90% N<sub>2</sub> mixtures where the PFCs were CF<sub>4</sub>,  $C_3F_8$ , and  $c-C_4F_8$ . They found that the breakdown characteristics of PFC/N<sub>2</sub> mixtures were better than those of PFC/CO<sub>2</sub> mixtures at a higher pressure range. The study of CF<sub>3</sub>I gas mixtures with N<sub>2</sub>, CO<sub>2</sub>, and CF<sub>4</sub> showed that 20% and 10% were the optimal mixing ratios for  $c-C_4F_8/N_2$  and  $c-C_4F_8/CO_2$ , respectively [144], [145]. The AC  $V_B$  of 20%  $c-C_4F_8/80\%$ N<sub>2</sub> was 46%–90% that of 20% SF<sub>6</sub>/80% N<sub>2</sub> under the same conditions and reached 57% that of SF<sub>6</sub> at 0.3 MPa. When 1% CO<sub>2</sub> was added to the 10% c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/90% N<sub>2</sub> gas mixture, its performance improved by 20%.

The  $C_3F_7CN$  and  $C_5F_{10}O$  gases introduced by 3 M, USA, as gas dielectrics with high DS have attracted wide attention in the last few years [146]-[149]. Nechmi et al. measured the standard LI breakdown characteristics of C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub> mixtures with C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN contents of 3.7%–20% [146]. The performance of 3.7% C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/96.3% CO<sub>2</sub> at 0.88 MPa was equal to that of SF<sub>6</sub> at 0.55 MPa, whereas the performance of this mixture at 1.04 MPa corresponded to that of  $SF_6$  gas of 0.65 MPa. Zhang et al. [147] conducted AC breakdown tests using rod-plate and needle-plate systems. They found that in the range of 0.1-0.12 MPa, 20% C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/80% CO<sub>2</sub> with a small electrode gap performed better than SF<sub>6</sub> gas, giving this gas mixture potential to replace SF<sub>6</sub> in medium-voltage switchgear. Zhang et al. studied the AC  $V_{\rm B}$  characteristics of C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/N<sub>2</sub> and C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures [148]. The breakdown performance of C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/N<sub>2</sub> at 0.3–0.6 MPa reached 49%–63% compared with  $SF_6$  gas at the lowest operating temperature of -25 °C and that of C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub> containing 2%-8% C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN at 0.2 and 0.3 MPa reached 60%-71% and 56%–68% compared with SF<sub>6</sub>, respectively. A study by ABB revealed that the DS of a  $C_5F_{10}O/CO_2$  gas mixture at 0.7 MPa was slightly lower than that of  $SF_6$  at 0.45 MPa and could reach the level of  $SF_6$  at 0.6 MPa at a pressure of 1.0 MPa [149].

In 2018, Tu et al. [107] reported the DC breakdown characteristics of C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures at 126 kV using a needleplate system. The  $C_3F_7CN/N_2$  gas mixing ratios were 4:96 and 8:92, and the gas pressure ranged from 0.3 to 0.7 MPa. The results revealed that the DC breakdown characteristics of C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures were strongly affected by polarity. At the same gas pressure, for both types of gas mixtures, the negative  $V_{\rm B}$  was much higher than the positive, and their difference increased with rising pressure. The magnitude of the negative  $V_{\rm B}$  increased with pressure, whereas the positive  $V_{\rm B}$  displayed the opposite behavior. The effect of polarity on  $V_{\rm B}$  can be explained by the different discharge processes of C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN gas under highly non-uniform electric fields. In addition, an interesting phenomenon was observed: the positive  $V_{\rm B}$  with higher mixing ratio was lower than that of the gas mixture lower mixing ratio. Overall, these results provide a theoretical basis for the application of C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures in DC GILs.

Generally, rising pressure of a gas gap can reduce the average free path of electrons, hinder the development of collision ionization and effectively improve the breakdown voltage. However, under a highly non-uniform electric field, the  $V_{\rm B}$  of the electronegative gas, whether AC, DC or impulse stress, may not increase linearly with the rise of pressure, but is greater than the corona partial voltage at lower pressure and tends to be consistent at higher pressure, showing a unique *N*-shape characteristic [150]. Scholars generally believe that this phenomenon of SF<sub>6</sub> and its substitute gases originates from the corona stabilization effect [151]–[155]. Corona discharge occurs at the tip of the needle electrode at lower voltages, resulting in a more uniform corona layer which improves the

electric field distribution around the tip and thus increases the  $V_{\rm B}$ . With increasing pressure, the diffusion of the corona layer is suppressed and a stable corona will not appear before breakdown, causing the reduction of the  $V_{\rm B}$ . This phenomenon is more significant in positive polarity than in negative polarity, and is more significant under steady-state voltage than under impulse voltage [150].

The non-uniformity of electrodes will influence the electric field. In addition, the increase of a needle-plate (or rod-plate) gas gap distance and the enlarging of the length of a metal protrusion under a quasi-uniform background electric field equal to reducing the gap distance can enhance the nonuniformity, leading to the decrease of the  $V_{B}$ . It is reported that the 50% double exponential impulse  $V_{\rm B}$  of SF<sub>6</sub> at 0.5 MPa decreases linearly when the non-uniformity coefficient of the electric field f ranges from 30 to 70 [123]. Zhou pointed out that the test results with different types of electrodes (coneplate and needle-plate electrodes) under highly non-uniform electric fields were divergent [151], which was similar to the literature [11]. The increase of  $V_{\rm B}$  of the C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub> mixture shows a saturation trend with the rise of pressure at the cone-plate electrodes with lower f value, but shows a remarkable N-shape characteristic at the needle-plate electrodes, whose reason lies in the strength of the corona stabilization effect. In addition, Feng stated that the N-shape characteristics would also appear with the increase of the electrodes gap distance [156].

According to the relationship between DS and volume fraction, the binary gas mixture can be divided into positive synergistic effect, synergistic effect, linear relationship and negative synergistic effect. The positive synergistic effect makes the mixture's breakdown behavior better than that of single insulation gases, which helps to reduce the insulation distance and manufacturing cost of the device. Many scholars have studied the synergistic effects of various alternative gases in order to find the optimal with the highest DS. AC breakdown tests of 30%CF<sub>3</sub>I/CO<sub>2</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> and 30%SF<sub>6</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> ternary mixtures [142] show that no synergistic effect is observed with the increase of CO2 content. For PCF mixtures and SF<sub>6</sub> mixtures, the synergistic effect of CO<sub>2</sub>-based mixtures is better than that of N<sub>2</sub>-based mixtures [144]. The synergistic effect of  $C_4F_8$  and buffer gas is in the order of  $SF_6/N_2$  <  $C_4F_8/N_2 < C_4F_8/CO_2 < C_4F_8/Air$  [109]. In addition, Zhang found that the synergistic effect of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures under negative polarity LI was much stronger than that of the positive polarity [124]. The above experimental research on synergistic effect has made many achievements, but it is still necessary to further deepen the research on the micro-mechanism of the synergy effect.

Under the positive polarity voltage stress, the zone around the rod electrode where the electric field is concentrated is ionized first and then gathers the positive space charge, reducing the electric field around the rod electrode and strengthening the electric field of the external space. So the discharge is easy to develop forward and the positive  $V_{\rm B}$  is low; when the negative polarity voltage is just the opposite, the  $V_{\rm B}$  is higher [122], [141], [143]. However, under a highly non-uniform electric field, the results of electronegative gas gap may be contrary to the more common, namely the polarity reversal phenomenon. Zhang found that the polarity reversal of  $SF_6$  gas appeared under the action of VFTO and LI under a highly non-uniform electric field [109].

#### 3) Partial Discharge Properties

At present, the research on the PD of  $SF_6$  substitute gases has focused on positive and negative half-cycle partial discharge initial voltage (PDIV<sup>+</sup> and PDIV<sup>-</sup>, respectively) and 50% lightning impulse partial discharge initial voltage (LI PDIV <sub>50%</sub>); little research on DC PD behavior has been reported. However, with the recent large-scale construction of HVDC transmission systems, it has become necessary to focus on the performance of SF<sub>6</sub> substitute gases under DC PD.

To evaluate the PD behavior of SF<sub>6</sub> substitute gases, simultaneous measurements of the PD current and the corresponding light emission phenomena are widely used to study the discharge process from PD initiation to breakdown in highly non-uniform fields. Hayakawa and co-workers studied the PD and breakdown mechanisms of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures under positive LI [157]. It is reported that there are two types of impulse PD modes: streamer discharge and leader discharge. And it was found that SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures showed a good synergistic effect. The PDIV <sub>50%</sub> value of a mixture containing 2% SF<sub>6</sub> at 0.1 MPa reached 60% compared with SF<sub>6</sub> and 240% compared with N<sub>2</sub>.

The PD behavior of conditional gases and new environmentally friendly gases including PFCs and CF<sub>3</sub>I has been investigated [158]-[160]. Saitoh et al. [158] found that the LI PD ability of air at 0.25 MPa along with that of  $N_2$ gas at 0.5 MPa was equivalent to that of  $SF_6$  at 0.1 MPa, which means that both air and N<sub>2</sub> are suitable to replace  $SF_6$  gas in C-GIS. The PDIV of  $C_4F_8/N_2$  was equal to or higher than that of  $SF_6/N_2$ , and the PDIV of  $c-C_4F_8/CO_2$  was 20%-30% higher than those of c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/N<sub>2</sub>, C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub>, and c- $C_4F_8$ /air mixtures [109]. Under the same conditions, the PD performance of 10% PFC/90% CO2 mixtures was superior to that of equivalent 10% PFC/90% N<sub>2</sub> mixtures [144]. The PDIV of c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub> gas was 1.2-1.4 times higher than that of SF<sub>6</sub> gas. The PD synergistic coefficient C of  $C_4F_8$  and  $N_2$ gas mixtures is from 0.27 to 0.58. The PDIV of a 15% c- $C_4F_8/85\%$  N<sub>2</sub> gas mixture was 65% compared with SF<sub>6</sub> gas and the PDIV of 20% c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/80% N<sub>2</sub> was equal to that of 20% SF<sub>6</sub>/80% N<sub>2</sub> and 0.70 times that of SF<sub>6</sub> gas. From the perspective of PD, a mixture of c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub> and N<sub>2</sub> with 10%-20%  $C_4F_8$  may be suitable to replace  $SF_6$  gas in GILs.

Results show that the PDIV<sup>+</sup> and PDIV<sup>-</sup> of CF<sub>3</sub>I/CO<sub>2</sub> were 1.2 and 1.0–1.4 times higher, respectively, than that of CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub> under AC voltages. That is, the synergistic effect of the former was larger than that of the latter [161]. Therefore, CF<sub>3</sub>I/CO<sub>2</sub> is more suitable than CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub> as an SF<sub>6</sub> substitute in low and medium-voltage electrical equipment. The optimal CF<sub>3</sub>I content was 25%–30% [162]. In addition, comparison of CF<sub>3</sub>I/CO<sub>2</sub> and SF<sub>6</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub> showed that the PDIV of CF<sub>3</sub>I/CO<sub>2</sub> was 0.9–1.1 times that of SF<sub>6</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub> with the same mixing ratio and the performance of CF<sub>3</sub>I/CO<sub>2</sub> was slightly better than that of SF<sub>6</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub>. The PDIV of 30% CF<sub>3</sub>I/70% CO<sub>2</sub> was about 70% compared with SF<sub>6</sub> [163]. The *C* value of CF<sub>3</sub>I/CO<sub>2</sub> was about 0.53 and PDIV<sup>+</sup> of CF<sub>3</sub>I/CO<sub>2</sub> with a CF<sub>3</sub>I content of 30%–40% at 0.2 MPa reached that of  $SF_6$  at 0.1 MPa. Therefore,  $CF_3I/CO_2$  is promising to replace  $SF_6$  gas in low-voltage electrical equipment, such as C-GIS [143].

The PDIV of 15% C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub> was equal to that of SF<sub>6</sub> at 80–120 KPa and slightly lower than that of 20%  $C_3F_7CN/CO_2$  under the same conditions [148]. The PDIV<sup>-</sup> of  $C_3F_7CN/N_2$  gas mixtures with 2%-12%  $C_3F_7CN$  at 0.3-0.6 MPa reached 62.8%-80.4% compared with SF<sub>6</sub> gas at a minimum operating temperature of -25 °C. The PDIV of  $C_3F_7CN/CO_2$  gas mixtures with 2%–8%  $C_3F_7CN$  in the range of 0.1-0.3 MPa reached average values that were 78%-86% compared with SF<sub>6</sub> at 0.3 MPa and about 66%-80% compared with  $SF_6$  at 0.15 MPa [149]. For electrode structures consisting of protrusion on conductor (POC) and protrusion on enclosure (POE) configurations, the PDIV of a 4%  $C_3F_7CN/96\%$  CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixture was 76%-81% of that of SF<sub>6</sub> in POC mode and 78%–84% of that of  $SF_6$  in POE mode [121]. In addition, the PDIV of 4% C3F7CN/96% CO2 at 0.5 MPa was equivalent to that of  $SF_6$  gas at 0.3 MPa. For application in GIE, the pressure or mixing ratio of C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN needs to be increased.

In 2018, Tu *et al.* reported the DC PD characteristics of  $C_3F_7CN/N_2$  gas mixtures at 0.5 MPa using needle-plate electrodes. The results are summarized in Table V. The mixing ratios of  $C_3F_7CN/N_2$  were 4:96 and 8:92. For the  $C_3F_7CN/N_2$ gas mixtures, PDIV<sup>-</sup> was higher than PDIV<sup>+</sup>. The PDIV values of the  $C_3F_7CN/N_2$  gas mixtures were higher than those of SF<sub>6</sub> gas under the same conditions. In addition, PDIV<sup>+</sup> of 4%  $C_3F_7CN/96\%$  N<sub>2</sub> was higher than that of 8%C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/92%N<sub>2</sub>, whereas PDIV<sup>-</sup> showed the opposite behavior.

TABLE V DC PDIV of  $C_3F_7CN/CO_2$  Mixture and  $SF_6$  at 0.5 MPa

Gases	PDIV <sup>+</sup> (kV)	PDIV <sup>-</sup> (kV)
SF <sub>6</sub>	21.77	27.27
4%C3F7CN/96%CO2	32.53	49.23
8%C3F7CN/92%CO2	24.03	56.75

## 4) Influence of Particles on Insulation Properties

Particle jumping height, particle lift-off electric field, and crossing electric field are parameters used in basic investigations to compare substitute gases with  $SF_6$ . The relationship between particle movement (jumping height, lift-off, and crossing) and the electric field strength on the enclosure inner surface has been evaluated. In general, particle lift-off, jumping height, and crossing to the HV conductor were similar for SF<sub>6</sub> and other gases at low electric field strength. The lowest electric field strength was achieved for N<sub>2</sub>. Compared with spherical metal particles, linear particles cause more electric field distortion and have the greatest effect on insulation degradation [164]-[166]. Distortion of the electric field near the tip of a linear particle causes corona discharge [167], [168], which ionizes numerous gas molecules in the region, as shown in Fig. 5. The ions generated by the micro discharge not only interacted with the metal particles, but also caused a largescale jet motion under the action of a strong electric field to generate an ion wind. The interaction of electricity and the ion wind affected not only the movement of linear metal particles, but also gas breakdown.

Studying the breakdown characteristics caused by metal particles under different gases is an important test method for the engineering practicality of SF<sub>6</sub> replacement gas. S. A. Ward *et al.* compared the sensitivity of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> and SF<sub>6</sub>/air mixed gas to the local electric field strength surge caused by metal particles under DC voltage and proposed a better performance SF<sub>6</sub> mixed gas component [168]. Wang. *et al.* performed a comparative analysis of the discharge sensitivity of free metal particles in C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub> and SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures under a DC electric field [169]. It indicated that although the breakdown voltage induced by metal particles is similar in different ratios of gas mixtures, the DSP values of particle discharge sensitivity of 4% C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/96% CO<sub>2</sub> and 20% SF<sub>6</sub>/80% N<sub>2</sub> are significantly lower than those of other ratios of gases.

## C. Flashover Properties of Gas-insulator Interface

Surface flashover properties of gas-insulator interfaces are important for the design of gas-insulated systems. Moreover, under the stress of a DC voltage, surface charge accumulation results in distortion of the electric field, which could be specific cause of surface flashover. This section summarizes information on the basic flashover properties of insulators in substitute gases for SF<sub>6</sub> by presenting the latest experimental results in this area of research. The flashover performance of substitute gases for SF<sub>6</sub> has only been evaluated in a few of the flashover studies under AC and LI voltages. To be comparable with commercial GIL conditions, DC flashover experiments of downsized insulators with different substitute gases and the flashover studies of spacers at 0.1 MPa under electric fieldtemperature stress and strong LI should be conducted. Finally, the latest research progress of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> and C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures in  $\pm$  100 kV DC GILs is described. In addition, the influence of particles at gas-insulator interfaces on their insulation properties is discussed.

## 1) Basic Properties

The dielectric strength of clean and particle-contaminated gas-insulator interfaces with different types of gases and gas mixtures have been investigated. This section reviews such interfaces under clean conditions. The spacers were made of epoxy resin filled with aluminum oxide.

In 2016, Xiao et al. [170] studied the flashover characteristics of insulators in c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub> under AC voltage stress. They found that the flashover voltage of c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub> at 0.1 MPa was 1.2 times that of  $SF_6$  gas. The flashover characteristics of c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub> insulators showed more obvious polarity than those of  $SF_6$ . The impact breakdown voltage of negative lightning was much larger (about 1.3 times larger) than that of positive lightning. Regarding the surface flashover performance of c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub> insulators, the results showed that the content and pressure of c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub> are important factors affecting the surface flashover performance of c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub> insulators under power frequency and LI voltages. At 0.10 MPa, the interfacial flashover voltage of 30% c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/70% CO<sub>2</sub> was 80% compared with SF<sub>6</sub>, and at 0.30 MPa, the interfacial flashover voltage of 30% c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/70% CO<sub>2</sub> was about 1.4 times that of SF<sub>6</sub> at 0.10 MPa. It is noteworthy that after many experiments, the damage of insulators in a c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub> gas environment was

more severe than that in  $CO_2$  and  $SF_6$  environments. When using  $c-C_4F_8$ , attention should be paid to the protection of insulators.

In 2016, Xiao *et al.* found that under 0.1 to 0.3 MPa, the relationship between the power frequency flashover voltage of insulators in the mixture of  $CF_3I/N_2$  and  $SF_6/N_2$  is as follows: 30%  $CF_3I/70\%$  N<sub>2</sub> >30%  $SF_6/70\%$  N<sub>2</sub> >20%  $SF_6/80\%$  N<sub>2</sub> [171].

The flashover voltages for a 30% CF<sub>3</sub>I/70% N<sub>2</sub> gas mixture were similar to those of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> mixtures with 20% and 30% SF<sub>6</sub> gas.

The flashover characteristics of insulators in  $CF_3I/N_2$  gas mixtures under DC voltages in the pressure range of 0.4 to 0.7 MPa were studied experimentally by Tu *et al.* [106]. The flashover voltage of the insulator in the  $CF_3I/N_2$  mixture was much lower than those in  $SF_6$  and  $SF_6/N_2$  gas systems. It is therefore considered that  $CF_3I/N_2$  gas mixtures are not suitable for use in high-pressure DC GIE.

Wang *et al.* found that the breakdown and flashover characteristics of  $c-C_4F_8/N_2$  gas mixtures under DC voltages were lower than those of pure SF<sub>6</sub> gas when the mixing ratio was 10%–20% [110]. Thus,  $c-C_4F_8/N_2$  gas mixtures are very promising to replace SF<sub>6</sub> as the insulating gas if the gas pressure or insulating distance is increased. However, the problem of decomposition and precipitation of carbon particles in  $c-C_4F_8$  during repeated discharge will cause a short-circuit of the air gap around insulators, which will damage the insulation structure.

Polarity effect of flashover properties of insulators was investigated in  $C_3F_7CN/CO_2$  gas mixtures under DC voltage [172]. It shows the positive and negative DC flashover voltages of  $C_3F_7CN/CO_2$  mixtures increased with increased gas pressure. The negative DC flashover voltages of 4%  $C_3F_7CN/96\%$  CO<sub>2</sub> and 8%  $C_3F_7CN/92\%$  CO<sub>2</sub> mixtures at 0.7 MPa were 96.06% and 101.50% compared with SF<sub>6</sub> at 0.5 MPa.

In order to study the flashover properties of spacers under the combined electric stress and thermal stress, Ma *et al.* set up an experimental platform, which consists of a coaxial cylindrical test model and an external-circulation oil heating system. The DC superimposed lightning impulse voltage is tested with 110 kV spacers with a  $SF_6/N_2$  gas mixture, at 0.1 MPa. The experimental results in Fig. 7 show that with the increase of pre-added DC voltage duration time, the flashover voltage under composite voltage is significantly lower than that under single lightning impulse voltage. The flashover voltage of the insulator with clean surface decreases by 10.34% compared with that of the insulator with impulse voltage acting alone when the surface charge accumulates and saturates [173].

Based on the results of downsized insulators in different types of Environment-friendly gases, we performed recent



Fig. 7. Flashover traces of insulators after DC superimposed impulse tests [173].

studies into the flashover properties of spaces in  $\pm$  100 kV DC GIL prototype filled with 0.7 MPa, SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixture and 0.7 MPa, C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures under combined voltage of DC with lightning impulse. The test scheme is to apply a positive 100 kV voltage to the DC GIL prototype, maintain the voltage for 2 hours, and then apply a negative lightning impulse voltage to the prototype to flashover for three consecutive flashover times. The time between the two continuous pulses should not be less than 1 minute. The flashover voltage should exceed over 5.5 times that of the rated voltage based on the 100 kV DC voltage.

Superimposed LI voltage test results in Fig. 8 show that the flashover voltage of DC insulators in a 20% SF<sub>6</sub>/80%  $N_2$  gas mixture at 0.7 MPa reached 915 kV [174]. The flashover voltage of an insulator in a 4% C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/96% CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixture at 0.7 MPa was 717 kV. These results both exceeded the assessment standard of 650 kV. These novel gas mixtures can pass positive DC voltage and negative LI tests. These environmentally friendly gases can meet the insulation requirements under DC voltage. The main assessment results for these mixtures are presented in Table VI.



Fig. 8. Flashover traces of insulators after DC superimposed impulse tests.

TABLE VI Test Results of DC Superimposed LI Voltage of Insulators in Environment-friendly Gas Mixtures

Gas Type	Flashover Voltage (kV)
20%SF <sub>6</sub> /80%N <sub>2</sub>	915
4%C3F7CN/96%CO2	717

## 2) Influence of Particles on Flashover Properties

The influence of these defects on insulation properties are important aspects for design, manufacturing conditions and service of gas-insulated systems. When there is metal particle fixing, adsorping or sliding along the surface of an insulator, the flashover voltage will be seriously lowered [175]–[179]. Investigation results, comparing different types of gases, are reported in the literature [180]–[184], including SF<sub>6</sub>, air, N<sub>2</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub> under AC and LI voltages. Under DC voltage, the SF<sub>6</sub> is still the main research area for metal particles. The comparative study of different new environmentally friendly gases is rarely reported.

The position(s) at which the particles attach to the surface of the insulator and the particle shape and size are important factors affecting the surface flashover of the insulator. For cone-type insulators, when the attached particles are located on the side near the high-voltage conductor, the flashover voltage is the lowest. At a certain position on the surface, the longer the linear particle or larger the diameter of the spherical metal particle, the lower will be the flashover voltage of the insulator. The adhesion of metal particles causes charge accumulation and distortion of the surrounding electric field, which is a necessary condition for initiating the lead and streamer. The current research primarily focuses on the influence of fixed metal particles on the surface charge and the flashover voltage along the insulator surface. However, the mechanism of the evolution of the surface charge on the insulator surface is not clear during the whole process of the development of the surface discharge, and the cooperative induction mechanism between particles and charges on the surface flashover remains to be established. In addition, the corresponding movement conditions should be considered, such as adsorption and sliding along the surface, which causes a greater influence. Moreover, the random disturbance of particle motion and the interaction of surface charge are still unclear, especially in different gases.

## **IV. RE-EXAMINATION: THERMAL PROPERTIES**

Current flowing through gas-insulated equipment generates heat. The associated temperature rise not only reduces the maximum current-carrying capacity of the conductor, but also affects the performance of the insulation material and reduces the service life of the equipment [185]. The  $SF_6$  gas used in GILs exhibits high thermal conductivity and allows heat to dissipate to keep the temperature rise in GILs at an acceptable level. If  $SF_6$  is substituted with another gas, it is necessary to examine the thermal properties of the new gas. There is a major difference between AC and DC GILs in terms of the heat source. Unlike the AC GILs, when the current passes through the internal conductor in a DC GIL, no skin effect occurs. Therefore, the equivalent resistance of the DC GIL decreases. In addition, no eddy current is induced in the enclosure. This allows the DC GILs to have a higher current capacity than that of equivalent AC GILs. At the same time, this feature also provides more design space for the potential improvement of the heat transfer performance of alternative gases to  $SF_6$ .

The physical model of convective heat transfer in GIL is shown in Fig. 9. The heat transfer characteristics and temperature rise effected in GILs can be determined via experimental testing and numerical calculations.

In 2016, GE Grid took the temperature rise test in their novel 420 kV GIL filled  $C_3F_7CN/CO_2$  gas mixture [186]. Due to the large share of  $CO_2$  in the mixture, the thermal performance of g3 gas is dominated by the gas  $CO_2$ . Investigations have demonstrated a reduction of approximately 10% of heat dissipation when using the same filling pressure as in SF6.

Based on of the studies described above, Chen. *et al.* established a temperature rise test platform for experimental studies and a three-dimensional (3D) simulation model for GILs using the thermal–fluid coupled finite element method [187]. Combining these two research methods, the corresponding heat transfer performance and temperature rise experiments were carried out. The results in Fig. 10 indicates that increasing



Fig. 9. Heat transfer mechanism of GIL bus bar.

the  $C_3F_7CN$  gas component ratio or pressure of the insulating gas mixture could improve the heat dissipation and currentcarrying capacity of GILs. The relationship between the heat transfer characteristics of AC and DC GIL was considered. A DC GIL has a higher current capacity than the equivalent AC GIL, offering a good solution for high-capacity energy transmission.

# V. MULTI-PERFORMANCE COOPERATIVE CONTROL MODEL FOR INSULATION GAS MIXTURES

Higher insulation performance usually requires gases with strong electronegativity, but most such gases are toxic with unstable chemical properties and low saturated vapor pressure. There are trade-offs between high dielectric strength and liquefaction temperature and high dielectric strength and low toxicity of gases. For the above reasons, although there are hundreds of alternative gases to  $SF_6$ , environmentally friendly insulating gases that can completely replace  $SF_6$  are still being explored.

Based on the GWP of alternative gases, the dew point temperature distribution of gas mixtures, and their insulation characteristics, a coordinated control model of alternative gases to  $SF_6$  was established for several environmentally friendly insulating gases, as shown in Fig. 11.

In terms of environmental friendliness, the goal is to lower the GWP to less than 30% of that of  $SF_6$ . According to the operational experience of HVDC GILs using alternative gases and the insulation performance of potential alternative gases, the insulation performance of alternative gases to  $SF_6$ generally reaches 70%-80% that of SF<sub>6</sub>. Charge accumulation of insulators in HVDC GILs induces electric field distortion and the flashover of cone-type insulators along the surface will be induced. As a result, the flashover voltage drops by about 10% [188]. Therefore, the insulation strength of  $SF_6$ alternatives needs to be more stringently controlled in HVDC GILs than in the case of AC GILs. It has been suggested that the substitute gases for SF<sub>6</sub> should be screened according to the breakdown field strength of the gas and maximum field strength of DC flashover at 0.4 MPa with 95% of the insulation strength of  $SF_6$  as the lower limit.



Fig. 10. Analysis on temperature rise of an environmentally friendly GIL and current-carrying capacity design. (a) Comparison of temperature rises of AC and DC-GIL conductors at different load currents. (b) Relationships between the current-carrying capacity of the GIL conductors and the gas pressure and ratio of  $C_3F_7CN$  [187].



Fig. 11. Multi-performance cooperative control model for alternative gases to  $SF_6$ .

According to IEC 62271–1, the application environments of environmentally friendly alternative gases can be divided into cold areas, normal outdoors, and normal indoors. The liquefaction temperature of a 20%  $SF_6/80\%$  N<sub>2</sub> gas mixture at 0.7 MPa is -63.4 °C, which means that this mixture can be used in cold areas. Meanwhile, 4% C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/96% CO<sub>2</sub> at 0.7 MPa can be used in DC GILs under most conditions to realize the complete replacement of  $SF_6$  gas because the liquefaction temperature of this mixture is -34.1 °C. The insulation performance of 6%-8% C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/92%-94% CO<sub>2</sub> mixtures at pressures of 0.6-0.7 MPa is better than that of a 4%  $C_3F_7CN/96\%$  CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixture. The insulation performance of SF<sub>6</sub> gas is 101% to 123% at 0.4 MPa. Because of its liquefaction temperature range of -19.4 to -25.5 °C, it is recommended that 6%-8% C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/92%-94% CO<sub>2</sub> mixtures are applied under indoor conditions or in areas with high temperatures. If both SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> and C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures can meet the application requirements, the use of the C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub> mixture is preferred. Application principles and selection suggestions for alternative gases to SF<sub>6</sub> for use in environmentally friendly HVDC GILs are listed in Table VII.

TABLE VII THE TYPICAL APPLICATIONS

Application temperature (°C)	Gas	Gas Pressure (MPa)
-50	20% SF <sub>6</sub> /80% N <sub>2</sub>	0.7
-30	4% C <sub>3</sub> F <sub>7</sub> CN /96% CO <sub>2</sub>	0.7
-10	8% C <sub>3</sub> F <sub>7</sub> CN /92% CO <sub>2</sub>	0.6-0.7

#### VI. CONCLUSION

This paper reviewed the research methods and properties of environmentally friendly gases for DC gas-insulated equipment. In particular, the progress of research on the main alternative gases to  $SF_6$  was described in detail. A multiperformance cooperative control model for alternative gases was established, and the gas application recommendations for DC GILs were given. We hope that this review with inspire the further directed exploration of alternative gases to  $SF_6$ .

Despite the existing research, there are still many topics that should be considered in future studies, including, but not restricted to the areas mentioned below.

1) Electron affinity and molecular ionization energy are difficult to obtain accurately and there is no obvious quantitative relationship between the dielectric strength of an insulating gas and microscale parameters such as ionization energy and electron affinity. It is still difficult to establish an accurate mathematical relationship between microscale parameters and macroscale electrical performance with clear physical meaning.

2) The existing results show that a mixture of electronegative gas and buffer gas can provide improved insulation and liquefaction performance to realize alternatives to  $SF_6$ . The synergistic effect of mixed gases and the microscale mechanism of this effect need to be further explored.

3) Searching for appropriate environmentally friendly insulating gases is a systematic project that needs to be considered from many aspects, including insulation properties, liquefaction, and heat dissipation. It is necessary to consider the optimization of the comprehensive performance of gases under multifactor coupling conditions.

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The authors gratefully acknowledge the contributions of Chengqian Yi, Xin Ai, Ying Zhang, Shaocong Wu and Yi Cheng for their work on this paper.

#### REFERENCES

- H. Koch, GIL Gas-Insulated Transmission Lines. Hoboken, NJ, USA: Wiley-IEEE, 2012, pp. 1–49.
- [2] T. Magier, M. Tenzer, and H. Koch, "Direct current gas-insulated transmission lines," *IEEE Transactions on Power Delivery*, vol. 33, no. 1, pp. 440–446, Feb. 2018.
- [3] D. M. Xiao, "Development prospect of gas insulation based on environmental protection," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 42, no. 4, pp. 1035–1046, Apr. 2016.
- [4] EPA, "Inventory of U.S. greenhouse gas emissions and sinks: 1990–2000," Office of Atmospheric Programs, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Washington, USA, 2002.
- [5] C. Y. Li, C. J. Lin, G. Chen, Y. P. Tu, Y. Zhou, Q. Li, B. Zhang, and J. L. He, "Field-dependent charging phenomenon of HVDC spacers based on dominant charge behaviors," *Applied Physics Letters*, vol. 114, no. 20, pp. 202904, May 2019.
- [6] D. M. Xiao, Gas Discharge and Gas Insulation. Berlin, Germany: Berlin Heidelberg: Springer, 2015, pp. 9–17.
- [7] M. S. Kamarudin, L. J. Chen, P. Widger, K. H. Elnaddab, M. Albano, H. Griffiths, and A. Haddad, "CF<sub>3</sub>I gas and its mixtures: potential for electrical insulation," in *CIGRE 2014*, 2014.
- [8] 3M, "3M<sup>TM</sup>Novec<sup>TM</sup>5110 Dielectric Fluid," Technical Data, Oct. 2015.
- [9] 3M, "3M<sup>TM</sup>Novec<sup>TM</sup>4710 Dielectric Fluid," Technical Data, Oct. 2015.
- [10] M. J. Elrod, "Greenhouse warming potentials from the infrared spectroscopy of atmospheric gases," *Journal of Chemical Education*, vol. 76, no. 12, pp. 1702–1705, Dec. 1999.
- [11] M. Rabie and C. M. Franck, "Computational screening of new high voltage insulation gases with low global warming potential," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 22, no. 1, pp. 296–302, Feb. 2015.
- [12] S. Qin, D. P. Liu, W. Li, Q. Y. Zhang, and Z. K. Guo, "Evaluation of global warming potential for greenhouse gases by experimental method," *Journal of Refrigeration*, vol. 39, no. 1, pp. 71–75, Feb. 2018.
- [13] J. K. Yu, "Progress in alternative technology of greenhouse gas sulfur hexafluoride," *Chemical Propellants & Polymeric Materials*, vol. 10, no. 4, pp. 41–48, Oct. 2012.
- [14] Ø. Hodnebrog, M. Etminan, J. S. Fuglestvedt, G. Marston, G. Myhre, C. J. Nielsen, K. P. Shine, and T. J. Wallington, "Global warming potentials and radiative efficiencies of halocarbons and related compounds: A comprehensive review," *Reviews of Geophysics*, vol. 51, no. 2, pp. 300–378, Jun. 2013.
- [15] T. J. Wallington, M. P. S. Andersen, and O. J. Nielsen, "Atmospheric chemistry of short-chain haloolefins: Photochemical ozone creation potentials (POCPs), global warming potentials (GWPs), and ozone depletion potentials (ODPs)," *Chemosphere*, vol. 129, pp. 135–141, Jun. 2015.
- [16] P. Blowers, D. M. Moline, K. F. Tetrault, R. R. Wheeler, and S. Lee Tuchawena, "Prediction of radiative forcing values for hydrofluoroethers using density functional theory methods," *Journal of Geo-physical Research: Atmospheres*, vol. 112, no. D15, pp. D15108, Aug. 2007.
- [17] C. Zhang, Q. G. Chen, L. Lin, and R. Qiu, "Gas GWP calculation method based on group contribution method," *Insulating Materials*, vol. 51, no. 10, pp. 78–82, Oct. 2018.
- [18] J. C. Devins, "Replacement gases for SF<sub>6</sub>," *IEEE Transactions on Electrical Insulation*, vol. 15, no. 2, pp. 81–86, Apr. 1980.
- [19] W. A. Wilson, J. H. Simons, and T. J. Brice, "The Dielectric strength of gaseous fluorocarbons," *Journal of Applied Physics*, vol. 21, no. 3, pp. 203–205, Aug. 1950.
- [20] A. K. Vijh, "Electric strenght and molecular properties of gaseous dielectrics," *IEEE Transactions on Electrical Insulation*, vol. EI-12, no. 4, pp. 313–315, Aug. 1977.
- [21] J. C. Devins and R. W. Crowe, "Electric strength of saturated hydrocarbon gases," *Journal of Chemical Physics*, vol. 25, no. 5, pp. 1053–1058, Nov. 1956.
- [22] A. E. D. Heylen and T. J. Lewis, "The electric strength of hydrocarbon gases," *British Journal of Applied Physics*, vol. 7, no. 11, pp. 411–415, Nov. 1956.

- [23] R. W. Crowe and J. C. Devins, "Sparking potential and molecular structure of unsaturated hydrocarbon gases," *Journal of Chemical Physics*, vol. 33, no. 2, pp. 413–418, Aug. 1960.
- [24] K. P. Brand, "Dielectric strength, boiling point and toxicity of gases - different aspects of the same basic molecular properties," *IEEE Transactions on Electrical Insulation*, vol. 17, no. 5, pp. 451–456, Oct. 1982.
- [25] M. S. Bhalla and J. D. Craggs, "Measurement of ionization and attachment coefficients in sulphur hexafluoride in uniform fields," *Proceedings of the Physical Society*, vol. 80, no. 1, pp. 151–160, Feb. 1962.
- [26] A. Olivet, D. Duque, and L. F. Vega, "Analysis of electron interactions in dielectric gases," *Journal of Applied Physics*, vol. 101, no. 2, pp. 023308, Jan. 2007.
- [27] N. Meurice, E. Sandré, A. Aslanides, and D. P. Vercauteren, "Simple theoretical estimation of the dielectric strength of gases," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 11, no. 6, pp. 946–948, Dec. 2004.
- [28] M. Rabie, D. A. Dahl, S. M. A. Donald, M. Reiher, and C. M. Franck, "Predictors for gases of high electrical strength," *IEEE Transactions* on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation, vol. 20, no. 3, pp. 856–863, May 2013.
- [29] J. T. Jiao, D. M. Xiao, X. L. Zhao, and Y. K. Deng, "Analysis of the molecules structure and vertical electron affinity of organic gas impact on electric strength," *Plasma Science and Technology*, vol. 18, no. 5, pp. 554–559, May 2016.
- [30] X. J. Yu, H. Hou, and B. S. Wang, "Prediction on dielectric strength and boiling point of gaseous molecules for replacement of SF<sub>6</sub>," *Journal* of Computational Chemistry, vol. 38, no. 10, pp. 721–729, Apr. 2017.
- [31] J. C. Rienstra-Kiracofe, G. S. Tschumper, H. F. Schaefer, S. Nandi, and G. B. Ellison, "Atomic and molecular electron affinities: photoelectron experiments and theoretical computations," *Chemical Reviews*, vol. 102, no. 1, pp. 231–282, Jan. 2002.
- [32] H. Hou, X. J. Yu, W. J. Zhou, Y. B. Luo, and B. S. Wang, "Theoretical investigations on the structure-activity relationship to the dielectric strength of the insulation gases," *Chemical Journal of Chinese Universities*, vol. 39, no. 11, pp. 2477–2484, Nov. 2018.
- [33] X. W. Li, L. Chen, M. L. Fu, R. Zhuo, D. B. Wang, and Y. Luo, "Review of screening sulfur hexafluoride alternative gases based on density functional theory," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 45, no. 3, pp. 673–680, Mar. 2019.
- [34] Y. Y. Duan, M. S. Zhu, and L. Z. Han, "Experimental vapor pressure data and a vapor pressure equation for trifluoroiodomethane (CF<sub>3</sub>I)," *Fluid Phase Equilibria*, vol. 121, no. 1–2, pp. 227–234, Jul. 1996.
- [35] H. Zhao, X. W. Li, and H. Lin, "Insulation characteristics of c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>-N<sub>2</sub> and CF<sub>3</sub>I-N<sub>2</sub> mixtures as possible substitutes for SF<sub>6</sub>," *IEEE Transactions on Power Delivery*, vol. 32, no. 1, pp. 254–262, Feb. 2017.
- [36] Y. K. Deng and D. M. Xiao, "The effective ionization coefficients and electron drift velocities in gas mixtures of CF<sub>3</sub>I with N<sub>2</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub> obtained from Boltzmann equation analysis," *Chinese Physics B*, vol. 22, no. 3, pp. 035101, Mar. 2013.
- [37] Y. K. Deng, B. Li, and D. M. Xiao, "Analysis of the insulation characteristics of C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>8</sub> gas mixtures with N<sub>2</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub> using boltzmann equation method," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 22, no. 6, pp. 3253–3259, Dec. 2015.
- [38] H. Katagiri, H. Kasuya, H. Mizoguchi, and S. Yanabu, "Investigation of the performance of CF<sub>3</sub>I gas as a possible substitute for SF<sub>6</sub>," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 15, no. 5, pp. 1424–1429, Oct. 2008.
- [39] Y. Kieffel, "Characteristics of g<sup>3</sup>-an alternative to SF<sub>6</sub>," in *IEEE International Conference on Dielectrics*, 2016.
- [40] C. H. Zhang, H. X. Shi, L. Cheng, K. Zhao, and H. B. Ma, "First principles based computational scheme for designing new SF<sub>6</sub> replacements," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 23, no. 5, pp. 2572–2578, Oct. 2016.
- [41] Y. P. Tu, Z. K. Yuan, B. Luo, C. Wang, X. J. Zeng, and X. Q. Dong, "Calculation on dew temperatures of binary gas mixtures SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> and SF<sub>6</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub> under 0.4–0.8 MPa gas pressures," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 41, no. 5, pp. 1446–1450, May 2015.
- [42] Z. K. Yuan, Y. P. Tu, C. Wang, Y. X. Zhao, and X. Q. Dong, "Experimental research on (vapor + liquid) equilibria for the {trifluoroiodomethane (CF<sub>3</sub>I) + carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>)} system from 243.150 to 273.150 K," *Journal of Chemical Thermodynamics*, vol. 101, pp. 49–53, Oct. 2016.
- [43] Z. K. Yuan, Y. P. Tu, C. Wang, S. C. Qin, and G. Chen, "Research on liquefaction characteristics of SF<sub>6</sub> substitute gases," *Journal of*

*Electrical Engineering and Technology*, vol. 13, no. 6, pp. 2545–2552, Nov. 2018.

- [44] CIGRE Technical Brochure 218, WG 23/21/33–15, "Gas Insulated Transmission Lines (GIL)", 2002.
- [45] Y. Kieffel, T. Irwin, P. Ponchon, and J. Owens, "Green gas to replace SF<sub>6</sub> in electrical grids," *IEEE Power and Energy Magazine*, vol. 14, no. 2, pp. 32–39, Mar./Apr. 2016.
- [46] Z. Y. Lee, "Measurements of breakdown potential and ionization and attachment in SF<sub>6</sub>-CO<sub>2</sub> mixtures," *IEEE Transactions on Electrical Insulation*, vol. 18, no. 6, pp. 637–641, Dec. 1983.
- [47] Y. C. Qiu and D. M. Xiao, "Dielectric strength of SF<sub>6</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures," *High Voltage Apparatus*, vol. 36, no. 3, pp. 7–11, Jun. 1994.
- [48] D. M. Xiao, Gas Discharge and Gas Insulation. Berlin Heidelberg: Springer, 2016, pp. 69–85.
- [49] J. Lucas and H. T. Saelee, "A comparison of a Monte Carlo simulation and the Boltzmann solution for electron swarm motion in gases," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 8, no. 6, pp. 640–650, Apr. 1975.
- [50] D. Y. Lim and S. Bae, "Study on oxygen/nitrogen gas mixtures for the insulation performance in gas insulated switchgear," *IEEE Transactions* on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation, vol. 22, no. 3, pp. 1567–1576, Jun. 2015.
- [51] L. C. Zhang, "Study on insulation characteristics of  $c-C_4F_8$  and its gas mixtures substituting SF<sub>6</sub>," Ph.D. dissertation, Shanghai Jiao Tong University, Shanghai, China, 2007.
- [52] M. S. Dincer and G. R. G. Raju, "Ionization and Attachment Coefficients in Freon-12 and CO<sub>2</sub> Gas Mixtures," *IEEE Transactions on Electrical Insulation*, vol. 20, no. 3, pp. 595–599, Jun. 1985.
- [53] Y. Qiu, X. Weng, and M. C. Zhang, "Measurement of ionisation and attachment coefficients in trichlorotrifluoroethane and SF<sub>6</sub> mixtures," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 20, no. 6, pp. 801–802, Jun. 1989.
- [54] M. S. Bhalla and J. D. Craggs, "Measurement of ionization and attachment coefficients in carbon dioxide in uniform fields," *Proceedings of the Physical Society*, vol. 76, no. 3, pp. 369–377, Jan. 1960.
- [55] J. L. Hernández-Ávila, E. Basurto, and J. De Urquijo, "Electron transport and swarm parameters in CO<sub>2</sub> and its mixtures with SF<sub>6</sub>," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 35, no. 18, pp. 2264–2269, Sep. 2002.
- [56] M. Yousfi, J. de Urquijo, A. Juarez, E. Basurto, and J. L. Hernandez-Avila, "Electron swarm coefficients in CO<sub>2</sub>-N<sub>2</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub>-O<sub>2</sub> mixtures," *IEEE Transactions on Plasma Science*, vol. 37, no. 6, pp. 764–772, Jun. 2009.
- [57] D. M. Xiao, X. G. Li, and X. Xu, "Swarm parameters in SF<sub>6</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 34, no. 24, pp. L133-L135, Dec. 2001.
- [58] Z. Y. Li, "A survey on the limiting breakdown strength and electron attachment rate constants in electronegative gas mixtures," *Acta Physica Sinica*, vol. 39, no. 9, pp. 1400–1406, Sep. 1990.
- [59] G. R. G. Raju and M. S. Dincer, "Measurement of ionization and attachment coefficients in SF<sub>6</sub> and SF<sub>6</sub>+N<sub>2</sub>," *Journal of Applied Physics*, vol. 53, no. 12, pp. 8562–8567, Jul. 1982.
- [60] H. Koch and M. Hopkins, "Overview of gas insulated lines (GIL)," in *IEEE Power Engineering Society General Meeting*, 2005.
- [61] F. Renaud, "220 kV gas-insulated transmission line-Palexpo Geneva Switzerland," in 2003 IEEE Power Engineering Society General Meeting, 2003.
- [62] S. R. Hunter, J. G. Carter, and L. G. Christophorou, "Electron attachment and ionization processes in CF<sub>4</sub>, C<sub>2</sub>F<sub>6</sub>, C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>8</sub>, and *n*-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>10</sub>," *Journal of Chemical Physics*, vol. 86, no. 2, pp. 693–703, Oct. 1986.
- [63] S. R. Hunter, J. G. Carter, and L. G. Christophorou, "Electron motion in the gases CF<sub>4</sub>, C<sub>2</sub>F<sub>6</sub>, C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>8</sub>, and *n*-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>10</sub>," *Physical Review A*, vol. 38, no. 1, pp. 58–69, Jul. 1988.
- [64] D. M. Xiao and Y. K. Deng, "Determination of electron swarm parameters in pure CHF<sub>3</sub> and CF<sub>4</sub> by a time-resolved method," *Plasma Science and Technology*, vol. 15, no. 1, pp. 25–29, Jan. 2013.
- [65] J. De Urquijo and E. Basurto, "Electron attachment, ionization and drift in c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 34, no. 9, pp. 1352–1354, May 2001.
- [66] J. De Urquijo, A. M. Juárez, E. Basurto, and J. L. Hernández-Ávila, "Electron impact ionization and attachment, drift velocities and longitudinal diffusion in CF<sub>3</sub>I and CF<sub>3</sub>I-N<sub>2</sub> mixtures," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 40, no. 7, pp. 2205–2209, Mar. 2007.
- [67] L. C. Zhang, D. M. Xiao, D. Zhang, and B. T. Wu, "SST experimental analysis on the feasibility of c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/CF<sub>4</sub> substituting SF<sub>6</sub> as insulation Medium," *Transactions of China Electrotechnical Society*, vol. 23, no. 6, pp. 14–18, Jun. 2008.

- [68] H. E. Nechmi, A. Beroual, A. Girodet, and P. Vinson, "Effective ionization coefficients and limiting field strength of fluoronitriles-CO<sub>2</sub> mixtures," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 24, no. 2, pp. 886–892, Apr. 2017.
- [69] A. Chachereau, A. Hösl, and C. M. Franck, "Electrical insulation properties of the perfluoronitrile C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>7</sub>N," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 51, no. 49. pp. 495201, Dec. 2018.
- [70] A. Chachereau, A. Hösl, and C. M. Franck, "Electrical insulation properties of the perfluoroketone C<sub>5</sub>F<sub>10</sub>O," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 51, no. 33, pp. 335204, Aug. 2018.
- [71] C. Yi, Z. Yuan, Y. Tu, Y. Zhang and C. Wang, "Measurements of discharge parameters in C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub> and C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures by SST," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 27, no. 3, pp. 1015–1021, Jun. 2020.
- [72] R. D. White, R. E. Robson, B. Schmidt, and M. A. Morrison, "Is the classical two-term approximation of electron kinetic theory satisfactory for swarms and plasmas?," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 36, no. 24, pp. 3125–3131, Dec. 2003.
- [73] H. Tagashira, Y. Sakai, and S. Sakamoto, "The development of electron avalanches in argon at high E/N values. II. Boltzmann equation analysis," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 10, no. 7, pp. 1051–1063, May 1977.
- [74] M. S. Dincer and T. Aydin, "Simulation of limiting field behavior in electron swarms in SF<sub>6</sub>+N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 139–145, Feb. 1994.
- [75] D. M. Xiao, L. L. Zhu, and H. L. Li, "Monte Carlo simulation of electron motion in SF<sub>6</sub>-CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures," *Journal of Shanghai Jiao Tong University*, vol. 33, no. 12, pp. 1482–1484, Dec. 1999.
- [76] B. T. Wu, D. M. Xiao, and L. C. Zhang, "Electron swarm coefficients in SF<sub>6</sub> and CF<sub>4</sub> gas mixtures from Monte Carlo method," *European Physical Journal Applied Physics*, vol. 35, no. 1, pp. 57–60, Jul. 2006.
- [77] H. Zhao, X. W. Li, S. L. Li, Z. F. Liu, and Q. X. Dong, "Study of dielectric breakdown properties in 50%SF<sub>6</sub>-50%CF<sub>4</sub> mixtures at 1 atm," *Proceedings of the CSEE*, vol. 33, no. 19, pp. 200–207, Jul. 2013.
- [78] Y. Deng and D. Xiao, "Analysis of the insulation characteristics of CF3I gas mixtures with Ar, Xe, He, N<sub>2</sub>, and CO<sub>2</sub> using Boltzmann equation method," *Japanese Journal of Applied Physics*, vol. 53, no. 9, pp. 3253–3259, Aug. 2014.
- [79] X. W. Li, H. Zhao, J. Wu, and S. L. Jia, "Analysis of the insulation characteristics of CF<sub>3</sub>I mixtures with CF<sub>4</sub>, CO<sub>2</sub>, N<sub>2</sub>, O<sub>2</sub> and air," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 46, no. 34, pp. 345203, Aug. 2013.
- [80] B. Li, Y. K. Deng, and D. M. Xiao, "Insulation characteristics of  $C_3F_8$ and  $C_3F_8$ -N<sub>2</sub> gas mixture using Boltzmann equation method," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 41, no. 12, pp. 4150–4157, Dec. 2015.
- [81] B. T. Wu, D. M. Xiao, Z. S. Liu, L. C. Zhang, and X. L. Liu, "Analysis of insulation characteristics of c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub> and N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures by the Monte Carlo method," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 39, no. 19, p. 4204, Oct. 2006.
- [82] X. W. Li, H. Zhao, S. L. Jia, and A. B. Murphy, "Prediction of the dielectric strength for c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub> mixtures with CF<sub>4</sub>, CO<sub>2</sub>, N<sub>2</sub>, O<sub>2</sub> and air by Boltzmann equation analysis," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 47, no. 7, pp. 425204, Sep. 2014.
- [83] J. Y. Xiong, X. W. Li, J. Wu, X. X. Guo, and H. Zhao, "Calculations of total electron-impact ionization cross sections for Fluoroketone C<sub>5</sub>F<sub>10</sub>O and Fluoronitrile C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>7</sub>N using modified Deutsch-Märk formula," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 50, no. 44, pp. 445206, Oct. 2017.
- [84] S. Y. Woo, D. H. Jeong, K. B. Seo, and J. H. Kim, "A study on dielectric strength and insulation property of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> mixtures for GIS," *Journal* of International Council on Electrical Engineering, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 104–109, Dec. 2012.
- [85] H. Zhou, Y. C. Qiu, Y. G. Tong, R. H. Li, and W. H. Zhang, "Insulation characteristics of N<sub>2</sub>/SF<sub>6</sub> gas mixtures," *High Voltage Apparatus*, vol. 39, no. 5, pp. 13–15, 19, Oct. 2003.
- [86] Y. Qiu and E. Kuffel, "Comparison of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> and SF<sub>6</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures as alternatives to SF<sub>6</sub> gas," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics* and Electrical Insulation, vol. 6, no. 6, pp. 892–895, Dec. 1999.
- [87] Q. Wang and Y. C. Qiu, "The application of N<sub>2</sub>/SF<sub>6</sub> mixed gas in Gas Insulated Cable (GIC)," *Electric Wire & Cable*, no. 1, pp. 28–29, 32, Feb. 2004.
- [88] Q. G. Chen, D. M. Xiao, and Y. C. Qiu, "Discharge characteristics of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures," *Journal of Xi'an Jiaotong University*, vol. 35, no. 4, pp. 338–342, Apr. 2001.

- [89] C. Guo, Q. G. Zhang, T. Wen, H. Y. You, Y. F. Qin, and J. T. Ma, "Synergistic effect of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures in slightly non-uniform electric field under lighting impulse," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 41, no. 1, pp. 69–75, Jan. 2015.
- [90] Z. Y. Qin, Y. Zheng, L. J. Wei, S. Yang, C. H. Zhang, and W. J. Zhou, "Impulse insulation property of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> mixture under low temperatures," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 43, no. 12, pp. 3907–3913, Dec. 2017.
- [91] X. L. Yan, K. L. Gao, Y. Zheng, Z. B. Li, H. Wang, J. He, and Y. Liu, "Progress of gas mixture and alternative gas of SF<sub>6</sub>," *Power System Technology*, vol. 42, no. 6, pp. 1837–1844, Jun. 2018.
- [92] K. L. Gao, X. L. Yan, H. Wang, J. He, Z. B. Li, C. Y. Bai, Y. Liu, and H. Huang, "Progress in environment-friendly gas-insulated transmission line (GIL)," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 44, no. 10, pp. 3105–3113, Oct. 2018.
- [93] A. V. Larin, N. Meurice, D. N. Trubnikov, and D. P. Vercauteren, "Theoretical analysis of the synergism in the dielectric strength for SF<sub>6</sub>/CF<sub>4</sub> mixtures," *Journal of Applied Physics*, vol. 96, no. 1, pp. 109–117, Jul. 2004.
- [94] J. Berg and E. Kuffel, "Breakdown voltage characteristics of SF<sub>6</sub>/CF<sub>4</sub> mixtures in uniform and non-uniform field gaps," in *Proceedings of* 1995 Conference on Electrical Insulation and Dielectric Phenomena, 1995.
- [95] Y. Luo, "Research on insulation properties of SF<sub>6</sub> substitutes in HVDC-GIL," M.S. thesis, Department Electronic Engineering, North China Electrical Power University, Beijing, China, 2016.
- [96] R. J. Liao, Y. Y. Du, J. Li, W. X. Sima, L. J. Yang, and X. T. Zhao, "Research progress of new environmentally friendly insulation gas," *Smart Grid*, vol. 3, no. 12, pp. 1118–1124, Dec. 2015.
- [97] M. N. Ngoc, A. Denat, N. Bonifaci, O. Lesaint, W. Daoud, and M. Hassanzadeh, "Electrical breakdown of CF<sub>3</sub>I and CF<sub>3</sub>I-N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures," in 2009 IEEE Conference on Electrical Insulation and Dielectric Phenomena, 2009, pp. 557–560.
- [98] L. J. Chen, P. Widger, M. S. Kamarudin, H. Griffiths, and A. Haddad, "CF<sub>3</sub>I gas mixtures: breakdown characteristics and potential for electrical insulation," *IEEE Transactions on Power Delivery*, vol. 32, no. 2, pp. 1089–1097, Apr. 2017.
- [99] L. J. Chen, H. Griffiths, A. Haddad, and M. S. Kamarudin, "Breakdown of CF<sub>3</sub>I gas and its mixtures under lightning impulse in coaxial-GIL geometry," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 23, no. 4, pp. 1959–1967, Aug. 2016.
- [100] Y. Cheng, C. Wang, F. W. Zhou, Y. P. Tu, and S. C. Qin, "Breakdown characteristics of SF<sub>6</sub> and CF<sub>3</sub>I as well as their binary and ternary gas mixtures from 0.1MPa to 0.25MPa gas pressures," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 43, no. 3, pp. 795–800, Mar. 2017.
- [101] H. E. Nechmi, A. Beroual, A. Girodet, and P. Vinson, "Fluoronitriles/CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixture as promising substitute to SF<sub>6</sub> for insulation in high voltage applications," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 23, no. 5, pp. 2587–2593, Oct. 2016.
- [102] X. W. Li, Y. K. Deng, X. Jiang, H. Zhao, R. Zhuo, D. B. Wang, and M. L. Fu, "Insulation performance and application of environmentfriendly gases mixtures of C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN and C<sub>5</sub>F<sub>10</sub>O with CO<sub>2</sub>," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 43, no. 3, pp. 708–714, Mar. 2017.
- [103] Y. Kieffel, F. Biquez, P. Ponchon, and T. Irwin, "SF<sub>6</sub> alternative development for high voltage switchgears," in 2015 IEEE Power & Energy Society General Meeting, 2015, pp. 379–393.
- [104] Y. Kieffel, A. Girodet and F. Biouez, "SF<sub>6</sub> alternative development for high voltage switchgears," 2015 IEEE Electrical Insulation Conference (EIC), Paris, France, 2014.
- [105] J. G. Owens, "Greenhouse gas emission reductions through use of a sustainable alternative to SF<sub>6</sub>," in 2016 IEEE Electrical Insulation Conference, 2016, pp. 532–538.
- [106] C. Wang, Y. P. Tu, Y. Luo, S. C. Qin, F. W. Zhou, and Z. K. Yuan, "Insulation performance of environmentally friendly gas applied to HVDC-GIL," *Proceedings of the CSEE*, vol. 36, no. 24, pp. 6711– 6717, Dec. 2016.
- [107] Y. P. Tu, Y. Cheng, C. Wang, X. Ai, F. W. Zhou, and G. Chen, "Insulation characteristics of fluoronitriles/CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixture under DC electric field," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 25, no. 4, pp. 1324–1331, Aug. 2018.
- [108] Y. P. Tu, X. Ai, Y. Cheng, H. Jin, and C. Wang, "DC breakdown characteristics of C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures," *Transactions of China Electrotechnical Society*, vol. 33, no. 22, pp. 5189–5195, Nov. 2018.
- [109] O. Yamamoto, T. Takuma, S. Hamada, Y. Yamakawa, and M. Yashima, "Applying a gas mixture containing c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub> as an insulation medium,"

*IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 8, no. 6, pp. 1075–1081, Dec. 2001.

- [110] R. Zhang, J. Wang, and P. Yan, "Insulation characteristics of c- $C_4F_8/N_2$  with less c- $C_4F_8$  applied to HVDC-GIL," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 44, no. 8, pp. 2672–2678, Aug. 2018.
- [111] R. Zhang, J. Wang, J. Li, C. Y. Ren, and P. Yan, "Insulation characteristics of environmentally friendly mix gas c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> substituting SF<sub>6</sub>," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 43, no. 2, pp. 414–419, Feb. 2017.
- [112] Y. C. Qiu, R. B. Li, and M. S. Liu, "Effect of electrode surface roughness and coating on SF<sub>6</sub> breakdown strength," *High Voltage Apparatus*, no. 1, pp. 8–12, Dec. 1987.
  [113] Y. Li and S. Ma. "The effect of surface roughness on breakdown
- [113] Y. Li and S. Ma. "The effect of surface roughness on breakdown strength in SF<sub>6</sub> for machined electrodes," *HIET Journal*, vol. 11, no. 3, pp. 211–218, Sep. 1988.
- [114] A. Pedersen, "The effect of surface roughness on breakdown in SF<sub>6</sub>," *IEEE Transactions on Power Apparatus and Systems*, vol. 94, no. 5, pp. 1749–1754, Sep. 1975.
- [115] O. Farish, O. E. Ibrahim, and B. H. Crichton, "Effect of electrode surface roughness on breakdown in nitrogen/SF<sub>6</sub> mixtures," *Proceedings of the Institution of Electrical Engineers*, vol. 123, no. 10, pp. 1047–1050, Oct. 1976.
- [116] Y. Qiu and I. D. Chalmers, "Effect of electrode surface roughness on breakdown in SF<sub>6</sub>-N<sub>2</sub> and SF<sub>6</sub>-CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures," *Journal of Physics* D: Applied Physics, vol. 26, no. 11, pp. 1928–1932, Nov. 1993.
- [117] Y. Qiu and F. L. Xiao, "Dielectric strength of SF<sub>6</sub>, SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> and SF<sub>6</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub> under different electrode surface conditions," in Sixth International Conference on Dielectric Materials, Measurements and Applications, 1992.
- [118] C. Guo, Q. G. Zhang, H. Y. You, T. Wen, J. T. Ma, and Y. F. Qin, "Influence of electric field non-uniformity on discharge characteristics and phenomenon of critical radius in SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures under power frequency voltage," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 43, no. 3, pp. 780– 787, Mar. 2017.
- [119] S. Xiao, X. X. Zhang, W. Q. Dai, and Y. F. Han, "Experimental research of CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures on power frequency breakdown performances under different electric field," *Proceeding of the CSEE*, vol. 36, no. 22, pp. 6276–6285, Nov. 2016.
- [120] Y. F. Han, "Experimental research on power frequency breakdown characteristics of CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures under different electric field," M.S. thesis, Department Electronic Engineering, Chongqing University, Chongqing, China, 2015.
- [121] G. M. Wang, W. H. Kim, G. S. Kil, S. W. Kim, and J. R. Jung, "Green gas for a grid as an eco-friendly alternative insulation gas to SF<sub>6</sub>: From the perspective of partial discharge under AC," *Applied Science*, vol. 9, no. 4, pp. 651, Feb. 2019.
- [122] M. Seeger, L. Niemeyer, and M. Bujotzek, "Partial discharges and breakdown at protrusions in uniform background fields in SF<sub>6</sub>," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 41, no. 18, pp. 185204, Sep. 2008.
- [123] X. D. Liu, L. L. Zhang, T. Wen, and Q. G. Zhang, "Influence of spike defect on the impulse breakdown characteristics of SF<sub>6</sub> gas gap in GIS," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 25, no. 4, pp. 1413–1420, Aug. 2018.
- [124] C. Guo, Q. G. Zhang, T. Wen, Z. B. Li, H. X. You, and Y. F. Qin, "Synergistic phenomenon of SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures in non-uniform electric field under lightning impulse," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 42, no. 2, pp. 635–641, Feb. 2016.
- [125] X. W. Li, H. Zhao, and A. B. Murphy, "SF<sub>6</sub>-alternative gases for application in gas-insulated switchgear," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 51, no. 15, pp. 153001, Mar. 2018.
- [126] X. Q. Qiu, I. D. Chalmers, and P. Coventry, "A study of alternative insulating gases to SF<sub>6</sub>," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 32, no. 22, pp. 2918–2922, Nov. 1999.
- [127] E. Kuffel and A. Yializis, "Impulse breakdown of positive and negative rod-plane gaps in SF<sub>6</sub>-N<sub>2</sub> mixtures," *IEEE Transactions on Power Apparatus and Systems*, vol. PAS-97, no. 6, pp. 2359–2366, Nov. 1978.
- [128] S. Ohtsuka, M. Koumura, M. Nakamura, S. Nagara, Y. Hashimoto, and M. Hikita, "Insulation properties of CO<sub>2</sub>/N<sub>2</sub>/50%SF<sub>6</sub> gas mixture under nonuniform field," *IEEJ Transactions on Power and Energy*, vol. 121, no. 7, pp. 830–836, Jul. 2001.
- [129] N. H. Malik and A. H. Qureshi, "A review of electrical breakdown in mixtures of SF<sub>6</sub> and other gases," *IEEE Transactions on Electrical Insulation*, vol. EI-14, no. 1, pp. 1–13, Feb. 1979.
- [130] T. Wen, Q. G. Zhang, Y. F. Qin, F. B. Tao, Y. Y. Jia, X. Y. Tan, H. Y. You, and T. L. Wang, "Influence of voltage polarity on breakdown of SF<sub>6</sub> rod-plate gap under VFTO and standard LI," in *11th International*

Conference on the Properties and Applications of Dielectric Materials, 2015, pp. 172–175.

- [131] Y. C. Qiu and E. Kuffel, "Development of the SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixture insulated transformer in China," in *Gaseous Dielectrics VIII*, L. G. Christophorou and J. K. Olthoff, Eds. Boston: Springer, 1998, pp. 519– 526.
- [132] N. H. Malik, A. H. Qureshi, G. D. Theophilus, "Static field breakdown of SF<sub>6</sub>-N<sub>2</sub> mixtures in rod-plane gaps," *IEEE Transactions on Electrical Insulation*, vol. EI-14, no. 2, pp. 61–69, Apr. 1979.
- [133] J. Zhang, X. Lin, A. Su, H. L. Chen, and L. W. Li, "Experiment on breakdown characteristics of SF<sub>6</sub>/CF<sub>4</sub> gas mixture under two typical electrode arrangements," *High Voltage Apparatus*, vol. 52, no. 12, pp. 93–98, Dec. 2016.
- [134] X. W. Li and H. Zhao, "Review of research progress in SF<sub>6</sub> substitute gases," *High Voltage Apparatus*, vol. 42, no. 6, pp. 1695–1701, Jun. 2016.
- [135] J. Wada, K. Yamamoto, G. Ueta, and S. Okabe, "Evaluation of breakdown characteristics of CO<sub>2</sub> gas for non-standard lightning impulse waveforms - breakdown characteristics for double-frequency oscillation waveforms under non-uniform electric field," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 21, no. 2, pp. 617–626, Apr. 2014.
- [136] J. Wada, G. Ueta, and S. Okabe, "Evaluation of breakdown characteristics of CO<sub>2</sub> gas for non-standard lightning impulse waveforms under non-uniform electric field-breakdown characteristics for singlefrequency oscillation waveforms," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics* and Electrical Insulation, vol. 18, no. 2, pp. 640–648, Apr. 2011.
- [137] J. Wada, G. Ueta, and S. Okabe, "Evaluation of breakdown characteristics of N<sub>2</sub> gas for non-standard lightning impulse waveforms - breakdown characteristics under single-frequency oscillation waveforms and with bias voltages," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 18, no. 5, pp. 1759–1766, Oct. 2011.
- [138] Y. K. Deng, Y. Ma, X. F. Chen, S. Q. Zhang, X. Y. Chen, and D. M. Xiao, "AC breakdown characteristics of CF<sub>3</sub>I-N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures in condition of quasi-homogeneous and extremely non-uniform electric field," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 43, no. 3, pp. 754–764, Mar. 2017.
- [139] Z. R. Ni, Z. M. Zhang, D. M. Xiao, and Y. Tan, "AC breakdown characteristics of CF<sub>3</sub>I/CF<sub>4</sub> gas mixtures in condition of extremely non-uniform electric field," *High Voltage Apparatus*, vol. 54, no. 7 pp. 153–156, Jul. 2018.
- [140] S. Zhao, D. M. Xiao, H. Zhang, and Y. K. Deng, "Discharge characteristics of CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub> mixtures under lightning impulse and alternating voltage," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 24, no. 5, pp. 2731–2737, Oct. 2017.
- [141] X. X. Zhang, S. S. Tian, S. Xiao, Y. Li, Z. T. Deng, and J. Tang, "Experimental studies on the power–frequency breakdown voltage of CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixture," *Journal of Applied Physics*, vol. 121, no. 10, pp. 103303, Mar. 2017.
- [142] X. X. Zhang, S. Xiao, Y. F. Han, and Q. W. Dai, "Analysis of the feasibility of CF<sub>3</sub>I/CO<sub>2</sub> used in C-GIS by partial discharge inception voltages in positive half cycle and breakdown voltages," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 22, no. 6, pp. 3234–3243, Dec. 2015.
- [143] M. Hikita, S. Ohtsuka, S. Okabe, and S. Kaneko, "Insulation characteristics of gas mixtures including perfluorocarbon gas," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 15, no. 4, pp. 1015–1022, Aug. 2008.
- [144] B. T. Wu, "Researches on insulation characteristics of  $c-C_4F_8$  and its mixtures," Ph.D. dissertation, Department of Electrical Engineering, Shanghai Jiao Tong University, Shanghai, China, 2007.
- [145] L. Lin, Q. G. Chen, X. Y. Wang, H. Zhang, H. R. Feng, and C. Zhang, "AC breakdown characteristics of c-C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures in an extremely non-uniform electric field," *Energies*, vol. 11, no. 12, pp. 3533, Dec. 2018.
- [146] H. E. Nechmi, A. Beroual, A. Girodet, and P. Vinson, "Fluoronitriles/CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixture as an eco-friendly alternative candidate to SF<sub>6</sub> in high voltage insulation systems," in 2016 IEEE Conference on Electrical Insulation and Dielectric Phenomena, Toronto, Canada, 2016, pp. 384–387.
- [147] B. Y. Zhang, N. Uzelac, and Y. Cao, "Fluoronitrile/CO<sub>2</sub> mixture as an eco-friendly alternative to SF<sub>6</sub> for medium voltage switchgears," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 25, no. 4, pp. 1340–1350, Aug. 2018.
- [148] Y. Li, X. X. Zhang, Q. Chen, M. L. Fu, R. Zhuo, S. Xiao, D. C. Chen, and J. Tang, "Study on the dielectric properties of C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>7</sub>N/N<sub>2</sub>

mixture under highly non-uniform electric field," *IEEE Access*, vol. 6, pp. 42868–42876, Jul. 2018.

- [149] P. C. Stoller, C. B. Doiron, D. Tehlar, P. Simka, and N. Ranjan, "Mixtures of CO<sub>2</sub> and C<sub>5</sub>F<sub>10</sub>O Perfluoroketone for high voltage applications," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 24, no. 5, pp. 2712–2721, Oct. 2017.
- [150] S. Zhao, D. M. Xiao, H. Zhang, and Y. K. Deng, "Investigation on discharge polarity effect of CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures under lightning impulse," *Proceedings of the CSEE*, vol. 37, no. 12, pp. 3636–3642, Jun. 2017.
- [151] T. R. Zhang, W. J. Zhou, Y. Zheng and J. H. Yu, "Insulation properties of C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>7</sub>N/CO<sub>2</sub> mixtures under non-uniform electric field," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 26, no. 6, pp. 1747–1754, Dec. 2019.
- [152] S. Ohtsuka, M. Koumura, K. Eguchi, and M. Hikita, "PD timesequential properties of SF<sub>6</sub> and SF<sub>6</sub> gas mixture including CO<sub>2</sub> under AC and DC voltage applications," *IEEJ Transactions on Power and Energy*, vol. 124, no. 2, pp. 313–320, May 2004.
- [153] I. Gallimberti and N. Wiegart, "Streamer and leader formation in SF<sub>6</sub> and SF<sub>6</sub> mixtures under positive impulse conditions. II. Streamer to leader transition," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 19, no. 12, pp. 2363–2379, Dec. 1986.
- [154] M. Hikita, S. Ohtsuka, S. Okabe, and G. Ueta, "Breakdown mechanism in C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixture under non-uniform field on the basis of partial discharge properties," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 16, no. 5, pp. 1413–1419, Oct. 2009.
- [155] L. Zhang, G. Q. Huang, J. F. Wu, Q. G. Zhang, A. X. Guo, and H. L. Yang, "Hump phenomena and mechanism of SF<sub>6</sub> gas discharge under impulse voltages," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 44, no. 2, pp. 527–533, Feb. 2018.
- [156] H. R. Feng, "Simulation of the substitutes for SF<sub>6</sub> and breakdown characteristics of typical gas," M.S. thesis, Department of Electrical and Electronic Engineering, Harbin University of Science and Technology, Harbin, China, 2016.
- [157] T. Wen, Q. G. Zhang, C. Guo, L. Zhang, Y. Ma, and X. Y. Tan, "Reversal phenomenon of discharge polarity effect in SF<sub>6</sub> rod-plate gap under impulse voltages," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 41, no. 1, pp. 275–281, Jan. 2015.
- [158] N. Hayakawa, Y. Yoshitake, N. Koshino, T. Ueda, and H. Okubo, "Impulse partial discharge characteristics and their mechanisms under non-uniform electric field in N<sub>2</sub>/SF<sub>6</sub> gas mixtures," *IEEE Transactions* on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation, vol. 12, no. 5, pp. 1035–1042, Oct. 2005.
- [159] H. Saitoh, K. Morita, T. Kikkawa, N. Hayakawa, and H. Okubo, "Impulse partial discharge and breakdown characteristics of rod-plane gaps in air and N<sub>2</sub> gases," *Electrical Engineering in Japan*, vol. 148, no. 3, pp. 36–43, Aug. 2004.
- [160] X. X. Zhang, J. J. Zhou, J. Tang, S. Xiao, and M. Zhang, "Experimental study of partial discharge properties for CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub> mixtures," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 39, no. 2, pp. 287–293, Feb. 2013.
- [161] W. J. Xing, G. Q. Zhang, K. Li, W. H. Niu, X. Wang, and Y. Y. Wang, "Experimental study of partial discharge characteristics of C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>8</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> mixtures," *Proceedings of the CSEE*, vol. 31, no. 7, pp. 119–124, Mar. 2011.
- [162] X. X. Zhang, J. J. Zhou, J. Tang, R. Zhuo, and Y. Chen, "Experimental study of partial discharge insulating properties for CF<sub>3</sub>I-CO<sub>2</sub> mixtures under needle-plate electrode," *Transactions of China Electrotechnical Society*, vol. 28, no. 1, pp. 36–42, Jan. 2013.
- [163] M. Hara, Y. Maeda, N. Nakagawa, J. Suehiro, and S. Yamada, "DC breakdown voltage characteristics of saturated liquid helium in the presence of metallic particles," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 13, no. 3, pp. 470–476, Jun. 2006.
- [164] K. Asano, R. Hishinuma, and Y. Yatsuzuka, "Bipolar DC corona discharge from a floating filamentary metal particle," *IEEE Transactions* on *Industry Applications*, vol. 38, no. 1, pp. 57–63, Jan./Feb. 2002.
- [165] M. M. Morcos, S. A. Ward, H. Anis, K. D. Srivastava, and S. M. Gubanski, "Insulation integrity of GIS/GITL systems and management of particle contamination," *IEEE Electrical Insulation Magazine*, vol. 16, no. 5, pp. 25–37, Sept./Oct. 2000.
- [166] J. Wang, Z. Y. Wang, X. R. Ni, and S. H. Liu, "Experimental studies on the motion and discharge behavior of free conducting wire particle in DC GIL," *Journal of Electrical Engineering and Technology*, vol. 12, no. 2, pp. 858–864, Dec. 2017.
- [167] H. X. Ji, C. R. Li, Z. K. Pang, G. M. Ma, X. W. Cui, W. J. Zhao, and J. Wang, "Influence of tip corona of free particle on PD patterns in GIS," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 24, no. 1, pp. 259–267, Feb. 2017.

- [168] Ward S A, "Optimum SF<sub>6</sub>-N<sub>2</sub>, SF<sub>6</sub>-air, SF<sub>6</sub>-CO<sub>2</sub> mixtures based on particle contamination," in *Conference Record of the 2000 IEEE International Symposium on Electrical Insulation*, Anaheim, 2000, pp. 292–295.
- [169] J. R. Wang, X. R. Ni, J. Wang, Q. M. Li, J. He and X. Xu, "Comparative analysis of discharge sensitivity by the free metal particles in C<sub>4</sub>F<sub>7</sub>N/CO<sub>2</sub> and SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures under DC electric field," in 2018 International Conference on Power System Technology, Guangzhou, 2018, pp. 2825–2832.
- [170] L. K. Man and D. M. Xiao, "Experimental study of the insulation performance of  $c-C_4F_8$  in a sphere-plate electrode gap and its surface flashover characteristics around an insulator," *High Voltage Apparatus*, vol. 52, no. 12, pp. 66–70, Dec. 2016.
- [171] H. Zhang, D. M. Xiao, S. Zhao, and B. Li, "Research on surface flashover characteristics of insulators in CF<sub>3</sub>I/N<sub>2</sub> gas mixtures," *High Voltage Apparatus*, vol. 52, no. 12, pp. 104–109, Dec. 2016.
- [172] C. Wang, Y. Cheng, Y. P. Tu, G. Chen, Z. K. Yuan, A. Xiao, O. John, Z. Agnes, and M. Nathan, "Characteristics of C<sub>3</sub>F<sub>7</sub>CN/CO<sub>2</sub> as an alternative to SF<sub>6</sub> in HVDC-GIL systems," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 25, no. 4, pp. 1351–1356, Aug. 2018.
- [173] G. M. Ma, H. Y. Zhou, Y. Wang, H. C. Zhang, S. J. Lu, Y. P. Tu, J. Wang, and C R. Li, "Flashover behavior of cone-type spacers with inhomogeneous temperature distribution in SF 6/N 2-filled DC-GIL under lightning impulse with DC voltage superimposed," *CSEE Journal* of Power and Energy Systems, vol. 6, no. 2, pp. 427–433, Jun. 2020.
- [174] Y. P. Tu, G. Chen, C. Y. Li, C. Wang, G. M. Ma, H. Y. Zhou, X. Ai, and Y. Cheng, "±100kV HVDC SF<sub>6</sub>/N<sub>2</sub> gas-insulated transmission line," *IEEE Transactions on Power Delivery*, vol. 35, no. 2, pp. 735–744, Jun. 2020.
- [175] B. Qi, C. R. Li, Z. Hao, B. B. Geng, D. G. Xu, S. Y. Liu, and C. Deng, "Surface discharge initiated by immobilized metallic particles attached to gas insulated substation insulators: process and features," *IEEE Transactions on Dielectrics and Electrical Insulation*, vol. 18, no. 3, pp. 792–800, Jun. 2011.
- [176] H. H. Zhou, G. M. Ma, C. Wang, J. Wang, G. X. Zhang, Y. P. Tu, and C. R. Li, "Review of charge accumulation on spacers of gas insulated equipment at DC stress," *CSEE Journal of Power and Energy Systems*, vol. 6, no. 3, pp. 496–517, Sep. 2020.
- [177] X. Jun and I. D. Chalmers, "The influence of surface charge upon flashover of particle-contaminated insulators in SF<sub>6</sub> under impulse-voltage conditions," *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, vol. 30, no. 7, pp. 1055–1063, Apr. 1997.
- [178] I. Al-Bawy and O. Farish, "Insulator flashover in SF<sub>6</sub> under impulse voltage conditions," *IEE Proceedings A- Science, Measurement and Technology*, vol. 138, no. 1, pp. 89–97, Jan. 1991.
- [179] S. Kaneko, S. Okabe, S. Tsukao, T. Kobayashi, K. Nojima, M. Takei, and T. Miyamoto, "Proposal of evaluation test method for withstand performance under residual DC charge at GIS insulator," *Electrical Engineering in Japan*, vol. 179, no. 1, pp. 21–28, Apr. 2012.
- [180] L. Zhang, S. Wang, L. Sun, A. X. Guo, Q. G. Zhang, and J. Wang, "Influence of metal particle on impulse flashover characteristics of insulator in GIS," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 44, no. 9, pp. 2807– 2814, Sep. 2018.
- [181] W. X. Sima, C. X. Liu, M. Yang, Q. Q. Shao, H. Xu, and S. W. Liu, "Plasma model of discharge along a dielectric surface in N<sub>2</sub>/O<sub>2</sub> mixtures," *Physics of Plasmas*, vol. 23, no. 6, pp. 063508, Jun. 2016.
- [182] Q. Q. Shao, W. T. Sun, W. X. Sima, H. Xu, M. Yang, and C. X. Liu, "Effect of a copper particle on DC surface flashover characteristics of epoxy resin," *High Voltage Engineering*, vol. 44, no. 5, pp. 1651–1659, May 2018.
- [183] X. Y. Tan, X. D. Liu, and L. L. Zhang, "Influence of metallic particles on the flashover characteristics of pillar insulator in SF<sub>6</sub> under impulse voltage," *High Voltage Apparatus*, vol. 53, no. 9, pp. 204–209, Sep. 2017.
- [184] X. Han, W. X. Sima, M. Yang, L. C. Li, T. Yuan, and Y. Si, "Transient characteristics under ground and short-circuit faults in a ± 500kV MMC-based HVDC system with hybrid DC circuit breakers," *IEEE Transactions on Power Delivery*, vol. 33, no. 3, pp. 1378–1387, Jun. 2018.
- [185] H. Koch and A. Chakir, "Thermal calculations for buried gas-insulated transmission lines (GIL) and XLPE-Cable," in 2001 IEEE Power Engineering Society Winter Meeting, 2001, pp. 857–862.
- [186] D. Gautschi, A. Ficheux, M. Walter, and J. Vuachet, "Application of a fluoronitrile gas in GIS and GIL as an environmental friendly alternative to SF<sub>6</sub>," in *CIGRE 2016*, 2016, pp. 1–11.

- [187] G. Chen, Y. P. Tu, C. Wang, Y. Cheng, H. Jiang, H. Y. Zhou, and H. Jin, "Analysis on temperature distribution and current-carrying capacity of GIL filled with Fluoronitriles-CO<sub>2</sub> gas mixture," *Journal of Electrical Engineering & Technology*, vol. 13, no. 6, pp. 2402–2411. Nov. 2018.
- [188] C. Y. Li, Y. Xu, C. J. Lin, G. Chen, Y. P. Tu, Y. Zhou, Z. P. Lei, T. Han, S. V. Suraci, J. Wang, W. D.Liu, M. T. Nazir, S. He. A. Cavallini, G. Mazzanti, D. Fabiani, and J. L. He, "Surface charging phenomena on HVDC spacers for compressed SF6 insulation and charge tailoring strategies," *CSEE Journal of Power and Energy Systems*, vol. 6, no. 1, pp. 83–99, Mar. 2020.



Zhikang Yuan received the B.Sc. degree in Electrical Engineering from North China Electric Power University, Beijing, in 2014. Currently, he is a Ph.D. candidate in Electrical Engineering at North China Electric Power University. His research interests include electrical insulation materials and high voltage engineering.



Geng Chen is a Ph.D. candidate in Electrical Engineering at North China Electric Power University, Beijing, China. His research interests include characterization of alternative gases for high voltage insulation and surface charge behavior, material modification for dielectrics in GIS/GIL.



**Guoming Ma** (M'10–SM'18) received the B.S. degree in Electrical Engineering from North China Electric Power University (Baoding) in 2006. He received his Ph.D. degree in Electrical Engineering from North China Electric Power University (Beijing) in 2011. Currently, he is an Associate Professor with the State Key Laboratory of Alternate Electrical Power System with Renewable Energy Source (North China Electric Power University), Beijing, China. His research interests are condition monitoring of power apparatus.



Youping Tu received the B.Sc. and M.Sc. degrees in Electrical Engineering from Chongqing University in Chongqing, China, in 1988 and 1991, respectively. Currently, she is a Professor in the Department of Electrical Engineering at North China Electric Power University in Beijing, China. Her research interests include advanced power transmission technology, dielectric materials, overvoltage and protection for power system. She is the author of more than 100 technical papers.



**Jian Wang** received the Ph.D. degree in High Voltage and Insulation Technology, from North China Electric Power University, China, in 2017. He is currently a lecturer at North China Electric Power University, China. His special fields of interest include high–voltage engineering, applied electromagnetics, condition monitoring and fault diagnostics.



**Cong Wang** received the B.Sc. and M.Sc. degrees in Electrical Engineering, North China Electric Power University, Beijing, in 2002 and 2012, respectively. He is currently a Senior Engineer in the Department of Electrical Engineering, North China Electric Power University, Beijing. His research interests include the properties of dielectric materials, gas discharge and online monitoring of electrical equipment.



**Bo Qi** received the B.S. degree in Electrical Engineering, the M.S. degree in High Voltage and Insulation, and the Ph.D. degree in High Voltage and Insulation from North China Electric Power University (NCEPU), Beijing, China, in 2003, 2006, and 2010, respectively. He is currently a Professor with the School of Electric and Electronic Engineering, NCEPU. His current research interests include condition monitoring of power apparatus, space charge measurement, electrical insulation, and materials.



Jue Wang received the B.Sc. and M.Sc. degrees in Electrical Engineering from Xi'an Jiao Tong University, Shaanxi, China, in 1996 and 2002, respectively. He is currently with the Institute of Electrical Engineering, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing, China. His current research interests focus on pulse generator, high-voltage insulation, and dielectric wall accelerator.



**Chuanyang Li** received the Ph.D. degree in Electrical Engineering from Tsinghua University in 2018. Currently, he works as a Postdoctoral Fellow at the Department of Electrical, Electronic and Information Engineering "Guglielmo Marconi" at the University of Bologna, Italy. His research interests include surface charge behavior, material modification for dielectrics in GIS/GIL, online monitoring of nuclear power cable insulation, and PD pattern recognition of HV motors and generators.